Correction

A Factual Correction to Bartlett, Vasey, and Bukowski's (2000) "Is Gender Identity Disorder in Children a Mental Disorder?"

Kenneth J. Zucker^{1,2}

In their article entitled "Is Gender Identity Disorder in Children a Mental Disorder?", Bartlett, Vasey, and Bukowski (2000) stated that "In the literature, it is often reported that children referred for gender 'problems' or diagnosed with [gender identity disorder] express the wish to be the other sex or feel that they are the other sex... though this symptom has been found to be present *in only a minority of cases*" (p. 760, my emphasis). Given that the verbalized wish to be of the other sex is one of the criteria in Point A of the *DSM-IV* diagnostic criteria for gender identity disorder (American Psychiatric Association, 2000), it is surprising to read that this "symptom" apparently occurs only in a minority of cases.

Bartlett et al. (2000) cited my own work (Zucker, 2000) to support this claim, noting that I "reported that between 17 and 36% of gender-referred boys... expressed cross-sex wishes" (p. 760). Unfortunately, this statement is factually incorrect. The correct data, which are based on maternal report on a standardized questionnaire, can be found in Table I. It can be seen that, of 201 gender-referred children (both boys and girls, not just boys), 76.1% were judged to express cross-sex wishes, not "between 17 and 36%"; in my comparison group of 380 control children, only 7.7% expressed a cross-sex wish, a 10-fold difference.

Bartlett et al. clearly misread the data in my original table. They *omitted* the percentage of children

who expressed the wish to be of the other sex "frequently/everyday." They also erred by not *adding* the two categories of "very rarely" (16.9%) and "once in a while" (35.8%), but instead described these categories as a range.

It is also important to note that my sample consisted of gender-referred children, not all of whom met the complete *DSM-IV* criteria for gender identity disorder. If one included only those children who met the complete criteria for gender identity disorder, the percentage would be even higher. My data on the verbal expression of the wish to be the other sex are consistent with other data that are available in the empirical literature, which Bartlett et al. did not cite; for example, Green (1987, p. 15) reported that 85% of the 66 feminine boys that he studied were reported by their mothers to either "occasionally" or "frequently" express the wish to be a girl. In his comparison group of 56 nonreferred boys, only 5% "occasionally" expressed a cross-sex wish, a 17-fold difference.

Table I. Maternal Ratings of the Wish to be the Other Sex

	Group	
	Gender-referred (<i>N</i> = 201)	Controls (<i>N</i> = 380)
Wish to be other sex ^a		
Frequently/everyday	23.4%	0.3%
Once in a while	35.8%	3.2%
Very rarely	16.9%	4.2%
Never	23.9%	92.4%

Note. Controls consisted of three groups of children: siblings, clinic-referred, and nonreferred ("normals"). Preliminary analysis showed no differences among the three types of controls, so their data were collapsed. The item is from a 16-item parent-report questionnaire (Zucker, 1992, pp. 332–334). Data reprinted from Zucker (2000, p. 677).

^a $\chi^2(3) = 296.5, p < .00001$.

¹Centre for Addiction and Mental Health, Toronto, Ontario, Canada.

²To whom correspondence should be addressed at Child and Adolescent Gender Identity Clinic, Child Psychiatry Program, Centre for Addiction and Mental Health – Clarke Division, 250 College St., Toronto, Ontario, Canada M5T 1R8; e-mail: ken.zucker@camh.net.

I trust that this correction will be helpful for the readers of *Sex Roles* in appraising the Bartlett et al. essay.

REFERENCES

- American Psychiatric Association. (2000). *Diagnostic and statistical manual of mental disorders* (4th ed., text revision). Washington, DC: Author.
- Bartlett, N. H., Vasey, P. L., & Bukowski, W. M. (2000). Is gender identity disorder in children a mental disorder? *Sex Roles*, 43(11/12), 753–785.
- Green, R. (1987). *The “sissy boy syndrome” and the development of homosexuality*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.
- Zucker, K. J. (1992). Gender identity disorder. In S. R. Hooper, G. W. Hynd, & R. E. Mattison (Eds.), *Child psychopathology: Diagnostic criteria and clinical assessment* (pp. 305–342). Hillsdale, NJ: Erlbaum.
- Zucker, K. J. (2000). Gender identity disorder. In A. J. Sameroff, M. Lewis, & S. M. Miller (Eds.), *Handbook of developmental psychopathology* (2nd ed., pp. 671–686). New York: Kluwer Academic/Plenum Publishers.