mater.scichina.com link.springer.com

REVIEWS

Published online 17 October 2017 | https://doi.org/10.1007/s40843-017-9095-4 Sci China Mater 2018, 61(2): 185-209

CrossMark

SPECIAL ISSUE: Innovative Electrode Materials for Supercapacitors

Hierarchically nanostructured transition metal oxides for supercapacitors

Mingbo Zheng, Xiao Xiao, Lulu Li, Peng Gu, Xiao Dai, Hao Tang, Qin Hu, Huaiguo Xue and Huan Pang^{*}

ABSTRACT Highly efficient, clean, and sustainable electrochemical energy storage technologies have been investigated extensively to counter the shortage of fossil fuels and increasingly prominent environmental problems. Supercapacitors (SCs) have received wide attention as critical devices for electrochemical energy storage because of their rapid charging-discharging capability and long life cycle. Various transition metal oxides (TMOs), such as MnO₂, NiO, Co₃O₄, and CuO, have been extensively studied as electrode materials for SCs. Compared with carbon and conducting polymers, TMO materials can achieve higher specific capacitance. For further improvement of electrochemical performance, hierarchically nanostructured TMO materials have become a hot research area for electrode materials in SCs. The hierarchical nanostructure can not only offer abundant accessible electroactive sites for redox reactions but also shorten the ion diffusion pathway. In this review, we provide an overall summary and evaluation of the recent progress of hierarchically nanostructured TMOs for SCs, including synthesis methods, compositions, structures, and electrochemical performances. Both single-phase TMOs and the composites based on TMOs are summarized. Furthermore, we also prospect the developing foreground of this field. In this view, the important directions mainly include: the nanocomposites of TMOs materials with conductive materials; the cobalt-based materials and the nickel-based materials; the improvement of the volume energy density, the asymmetric SCs, and the flexible all-solid-state SCs.

Keywords: hierarchical nanostructure, transition metal oxides, supercapacitors

INTRODUCTION

With the rapid development of global economy, energy

shortage and environmental pollution have become two extremely important issues worldwide. A breakthrough in exploiting highly efficient and clean energy storage technologies is necessary to satisfy future energy requirements [1-6]. The electrochemical energy storage is the most promising approach because of its high efficiency, good reliability, ease of operation, and good ecofriendly character [7-18]. Electrochemical energy storage technologies mainly include batteries and supercapacitors (SCs) [19,20]. As a new energy storage approach, SCs combine the advantages of high energy density of rechargeable batteries and high power density of dielectric capacitors [19-29]. SCs have been regarded as highly important candidates for energy storage devices because of their fast charging-discharging capability, long cycle stability (>10⁵ cycles), high power density (>10 kW kg⁻¹), low cost, environment-friendly nature, low maintenance, and safe operation [30-46]. In certain fields, SCs can partly or fully replace traditional batteries.

SCs can be divided into two categories according to energy storage mechanism: electrical double-layer capacitors (EDLCs) (Fig. 1a) and pseudocapacitors (Fig. 1b) [19–21]. The capacitance of EDLCs is associated with the charge separation and accumulation at the interface between electrode and electrolyte [19–21]. During charging, the electric charges on the surface of electrode attract the ions with opposite charges in the electrolyte. Thus, the electric double layer is formed on the surface of electrode and the energy stroge is realized. The capacitance stored in the electric double layer is proportional to the specific surface area of the electrolyte and electrons flow into the external circuit. Nanostructured carbon materials, such as mesoporous carbon, activated carbon, carbon nanotubes,

School of Chemistry and Chemical Engineering, Institute for Innovative Materials and Energy, Yangzhou University, Yangzhou 225009, China * Corresponding author (emails: huanpangchem@hotmail.com or panghuan@yzu.edu.cn)



Figure 1 Schematic of the two different mechanisms of SCs: (a) EDLCs and (b) pseudocapacitors.

carbon nanofibers, and graphene, have been widely studied as the electrode materials of EDLCs. The capacitance of pseudocapacitors is derived from the fast and reversible Faradaic process (redox reactions) occurring on the surface or near surface of the electrode materials [19– 21]. Although the generation process of pseudocapacitance involves redox reactions, it is different from the reaction process of battery. The battery is controlled by the ion diffusion within the crystalline framework of active material; while the pseudocapacitor is not limited by the diffusion process [19]. Therefore, the pseudocapacitor possesses highly dynamic reversibility and is more closer to the characteristics of the capacitor. The electrode materials of pseudocapacitors mainly include transition metal oxides (TMOs) and conductive polymers.

Conventional carbon material-based EDLCs usually exhibit low specific capacitance [19,20]. TMOs, which possess multiple oxidation states, could achieve markedly larger specific capacitance than carbon materials [19,20]. Early investigations on electrode materials have concentrated on noble TMOs, such as RuO₂ and IrO₂. RuO₂ with three oxidation states within 1.4 V, indicating a large specific capacitance of 2000 F g^{-1} [47,48]. However, the exceedingly high cost and environmentally poisonous nature limit their practical applications. Hence, cheap and high-performance TMOs, such as MnO₂, NiO, Co₃O₄, and CuO, have been extensively studied as the electrode materials for SCs [49-54]. Moreover, multiple-metal TMOs, such as NiCo₂O₄, NiCoO₂, and ZnV₂O₄, have also attracted considerable interest because these materials can provide better electrochemical performance compared with single-metal TMOs [55-57]. TMOs with a variety of structures and morphologies, such as thin films, nanowires/nanorods, nanotubes, nanosheets, nanoflowers, and hollow nanospheres, have been fabricated *via* different synthesis routes [49–60]. Moreover, their electrochemical properties have been extensively investigated.

Hierarchically nanostructured materials are self-assembly systems that are assembled from low dimensional nanobuilding blocks, such as nanoparticles (NPs), nanowires, nanorods, nanotubes, and nanosheets [61,62]. Recently, hierarchically nanostructured TMO materials have gradually become a research hotspot in SC field because of their unique structures [63–67]. These structures could offer large specific surface area, abundant accessible electroactive sites, and short ion diffusion pathway during the rapid charge-discharge process [63-67]. Hierarchically nanostructured TMOs exhibit higher power properties, larger specific capacitances, and more outstanding cycle stabilities compared with common TMOs. In this review, we mainly expound the topic of hierarchically nanostructured TMO electrode materials for SCs. The synthesis and electrochemical performance of hierarchically nanostructured single- or multiphase TMOs are systematically reviewed. We emphasize on several advanced TMO-based composite materials with excellent electrochemical properties, which mainly originate from advantageous compositional and structural characteristics. In addition, we propose several personal prospects to motivate further development of hierarchically nanostructured TMOs for SCs.

The following sections describe the hierarchically nanostructured TMOs as electrode materials for SCs. The summary mainly is divided into two parts: one is singlephase TMOs, and the other is the composites based on TMOs. Unless otherwise noted, the electrochemical tests are mainly investigated in three-electrode systems. The electrolytes for all works are shown in parentheses.

HIERARCHICALLY NANOSTRUCTURED SINGLE-PHASE TMOs FOR SCs

Manganese oxides

Electrochemical SCs based on manganese dioxide (MnO₂) have attracted considerable interest because of its rich polymorphisms (α -, β -, γ -, δ -, λ -, and ϵ -type), high theoretical specific capacitance, high natural abundance, and good environmental compatibility [68–75].

Flower-like hierarchical α -MnO₂ sub-microspheres were successfully fabricated by Yuan and coworkers *via* a novel interfacial strategy [76]. The Brunauer–Emmett– Teller (BET) specific surface area of the α -MnO₂ sample is 216 m² g⁻¹. To evaluate electrochemical performance, the hierarchical α -MnO₂ material was investigated *via* cyclic

REVIEWS



Figure 2 (a) SEM and (b), (c) TEM images of the LT-MnO₂. Electrochemical properties of the three samples; (d) galvanostatic charge–discharge curves at 0.5 A g⁻¹; (e) specific capacitances at various current densities; (f) Ragone plots. Reproduced with permission from Ref. [79]. Copyright 2012, the Royal Society of Chemistry.

voltammetry (CV), cyclic chronopotentiometry (CC), and electrochemical impedance spectroscopy in 1 mol L⁻¹ K₂SO₄. The electrochemical measurement results in high specific capacitances of 298 and 236 F g⁻¹ at 0.117 and 2.353 A g⁻¹, respectively. Furthermore, the α -MnO₂ sample shows 90% retention after 2,000 cycles at 2 A g⁻¹. The good performance is ascribed to the special hierarchical structure and rich MnO₂-electrolyte interfaces.

Lee *et al.* [77] prepared hierarchical nanostructures of hydrated α -MnO₂ by one-step synthesis at room temperature. The α -MnO₂ sample consists of small ultrathin nanorod-like structures with diameters of 2–4 nm. The MnO₂ electrode delivers a high specific capacitance of 356 F g⁻¹ at 2 A g⁻¹ (1 mol L⁻¹ Na₂SO₄). After 2,000 cycles of cycling test, no capacitance degradation is observed.

 β -MnO₂ as electrode material in SCs is also investigated. Zhao *et al.* [78] successfully fabricated hierarchical porous β -MnO₂ nanoflowers assembled by ultrathin nanoplates at room temperature. The BET specific surface area of the β -MnO₂ sample is as high as 267 m² g⁻¹. The electrochemical measurements demonstrate that the sample possesses a large energy density of 22.6 W h kg⁻¹ at a high power density of 9.1 kW g⁻¹, with a high specific capacitance of 201.5 F g⁻¹ (1 mol L⁻¹ Na₂ SO₄). Furthermore, at 2 mV s⁻¹, the specific capacitance reaches up to 296.3 F g⁻¹, which is evidently superior to

those of $\beta\text{-MnO}_2$ powders (~7 F g^{-1}) and $\beta\text{-MnO}_2$ nanorods (14.9 F g^{-1}).

Using a simple and scalable method, Li et al. [79] prepared hierarchical MnO₂ nanostructures assembled by ultrathin nanoflakes. The resulting products labeled as LT-MnO₂, RT-MnO₂, and HT-MnO₂ (LT, RT, and HT represent low temperature, room temperature, and high temperature, respectively) were synthesized by conducting the reaction in an ice bath, at room temperature, and at 100 °C. Scanning electron microscopy (SEM) and transmission electron microscopy (TEM) images of LT-MnO₂ are shown in Fig. 2a-c. The MnO₂ nanospheres are assembled by small nanoflakes with low crystallinity. The LT-MnO₂ displays the largest specific surface area $(269.0 \text{ m}^2 \text{ g}^{-1})$ compared with the RT-MnO₂ (173.6 $m^2 g^{-1}$) and HT-MnO₂ (164.6 $m^2 g^{-1}$). In addition, the LT-MnO₂ possesses the highest specific capacitance (176 F g^{-1}) at 20 A g⁻¹ (1 mol L⁻¹ Na₂SO₄) compared with the RT-MnO₂ (140 F g⁻¹) and HT-MnO₂ (120 F g⁻¹) (shown in Fig. 2d, e). As shown in Fig. 2f, at a power density of 250 W kg⁻¹, the LT-MnO₂ also shows the highest energy density of 45.6 W h kg⁻¹ among the three samples (RT-MnO₂ with 42.2 W h kg⁻¹ and HT-MnO₂ with 37.9 W h kg⁻¹) [76–79].

Raj et al. [80] synthesized hierarchical mesoporous δ -MnO₂ via an easy single-step and template-free method.

This hierarchical mesoporous δ -MnO₂ has a large BET specific surface area of 238 m²g⁻¹. The specific capacitance of δ -MnO₂ is 364 F g⁻¹ at 1 A g⁻¹ (1 mol L⁻¹ Na₂ SO₄). Furthermore, the asymmetric SCs device with a large voltage window of 0–2 V was fabricated by using δ -MnO₂ as the cathode and activated carbon as the anode. The device shows a specific capacitance of 86.5 F g⁻¹ at 1 A g⁻¹ and a capacitance retention of 100% after 3,000 cycles at 20 A g⁻¹. The device exhibits a high energy density of 48.06 W h kg⁻¹ at a power density of 1.0 kW kg⁻¹.

Cobalt oxides

Among TMOs, Co_3O_4 is also considered as a highly promising material due to its cost effectiveness, environmental benignancy, and ultrahigh theoretical specific capacitance (3560 F g⁻¹) [81–84]. Cobalt oxides with a variety of structures and morphologies, such as NPs [85], nanowires [86], nanorods [87], nanosheets [88], and porous nanostructures [89,90], have been fabricated *via* electrochemical and/or chemical routes, and the corresponding electrochemical performance is under intensive investigation.

A hydrothermal strategy based on a self-assembled monolayer polystyrene sphere template was used by Cao *et al.* [91] for the fabrication of hierarchical porous Co_3O_4 film. The Co_3O_4 film is approximately 20 nm thick. The specific capacitances of the Co_3O_4 films are 352 and 291 F g⁻¹ at 2 and 40 A g⁻¹ (2 mol L⁻¹ KOH), respectively. These specific capacitances are higher than that of the sample obtained without using a template (325 and 217 F g⁻¹ at 2 and 40 A g⁻¹).

Xiao *et al.* [92] prepared three-dimensional (3D) enoki mushroom-like Co_3O_4 hierarchitectures *via* an easy reflux method. The primary structure of Co_3O_4 hierarchitectures is the nanowire with a diameter of approximately 3.2 µm. Each Co_3O_4 nanowire is made up of numerous Co_3O_4 NPs. The Co_3O_4 material displays a large specific capacitance of 787 F g⁻¹ at 1 A g⁻¹ (6 mol L⁻¹ KOH), and a capacity retention of 94.5% after 1,000 cycles at 10 A g⁻¹. The asymmetric SCs device (carbon mateials as anode) exhibits an energy density of 23.9 W h kg⁻¹ at 0.5 A g⁻¹, together with a power density of 0.375 kW kg⁻¹. The unique 3D enoki mushroom-like hierarchitectures could evidently improve the rate of ion diffusion and the stability of electrodes, which results in considerable electrochemical performances of the Co_3O_4 material.

Qu *et al.* [93] reported that hollow fluffy cages (HFC) of Co_3O_4 were prepared by the formation of $Co(OH)_2$ hollow cages and subsequent calcination at different

temperature. The HFC of Co₃O₄ was annealed at 250, 300, and 400°C, respectively. The synthetic scheme for HFC Co₃O₄ is shown in Fig. 3a. The TEM image of Cu₂O template (Fig. 3b) displays a polyhedron structure with a size of ~250 nm. As shown in Fig. 3c, the size of the internal voids of the as-prepared hollow cages is \sim 250 nm, which is inherited from the dimensions of the Cu₂O templates. As evidenced in the TEM image (Fig. 3d), the morphology of the HFC-like nanostructure is excellently preserved after annealing at 250°C. The specific surface area of HFC-250 is approximately 245.5 $m^2 g^{-1}$, which is substantially higher than those of HFC-300 (120 m² g⁻¹) and HFC-400 (67.3 m² g⁻¹). The nearly symmetric charge-discharge curves imply that the HFC-250 delivers high coulombic efficiency and low polarization (Fig. 3e). At 1 A g^{-1} (shown in Fig. 3f), the HFC-250 electrode possesses the largest specific capacitance (948.9 F g^{-1}), which is markedly larger than those of HFC Co(OH)₂ (400.7 F g⁻¹), HFC-300 (489.9 F g⁻¹), HFC-400 (297 F g^{-1}), and Co₃O₄-common (151.3 F g^{-1}) electrodes (2 mol L^{-1} KOH). Furthermore, the HFC-250 exhibits superior rate performance (Fig. 3g) and good cycle stability.

Nickel oxides

Nickel oxides have been widely studied in SCs field because of their high theoretical capacity (2573 F g⁻¹), cost effectiveness, and environmental friendliness [94–99]. By an easy hydrothermal method, Hu *et al.* [100] designed and synthesized hierarchical NiO nanosheets/nanowires with Ni foam substrate. The specific capacitances of the electrodes are 1493 and 867 F g⁻¹ at 3 and 50 A g⁻¹ (6 mol L⁻¹ KOH), respectively, which are superior to those of the mesoporous NiO nanosheets (1250 and 633 F g⁻¹ at 3 and 50 A g⁻¹, respectively). Furthermore, the unique hierarchical NiO nanosheet/nanowire electrodes exhibit good rate performance and good cycling stability.

Using a successive electrode-position method with ZnO nanorods as template on Ni foam, Cao *et al.* [101] synthesized 3D hierarchical NiO nanotube arrays. Fig. 4a shows the schematic for synthesizing this material. As seen in the SEM and TEM (Fig. 4b, c) images, the sample is consisted of interconnected branch nanoflakes (~10 nm), and the diameter of nanotube is ~170 nm. Owing to the special hierarchical porous structure, the NiO nanotube arrays show high specific capacitances of 675 and 569 F g⁻¹ at 2 and 40 A g⁻¹ (1 mol L⁻¹ Na₂SO₄) (Fig. 4g), respectively. The pseudocapacitive performance of NiO nanotube arrays on Ni foil and Ni foam were also



Figure 3 (a) Schematic of the preparation of $Co(OH)_2$ and Co_3O_4 . TEM images for (b) Cu_2O template, (c) $Co(OH)_2$, and (d) Co_3O_4 . (e) Chargedischarge curves of the HFC-250 electrode. (f) Plots of the specific capacitance of $Co(OH)_2$, HFC-250, HFC-300, HFC-400, and Co_3O_4 -com. (g) Rate capability of the HFC-250 electrode when the current density was progressively varied. Reproduced with permission from Ref. [93]. Copyright 2015, the American Chemical Society.

compared. The specific capacitance of the NiO on the Ni foil is 495 F g⁻¹ at 2 A g⁻¹, which is lower than that of the NiO on Ni foam (675 F g⁻¹ at 2 A g⁻¹). The porous NiO arrays on Ni foam electrode demonstrate a low loss of 6.8% after 10,000 cycles at 2 A g⁻¹. This excellent electrochemical performance can be ascribed to the hierarchical porous architecture with large reaction surface area and fast ion transfer. This synthesis method can potentially be applied to the fabrication of other TMO nanotube arrays.

Multi-shell self-assembled hollow structure materials are also investigated in SCs. Zhu *et al.* [102] designed and prepared single-, double-, and triple-shelled NiO (S–NiO, D–NiO, and T–NiO, respectively) hollow nanospheres by a controllable layer-by-layer self-assembly method with the calcination of Ni(OH)₂/C precursors. The BET specific surface area of the D–NiO is approximately 92.99 m² g⁻¹, which is higher than those of T–NiO (23.45 m² g⁻¹) and S–NiO (61.63 m² g⁻¹). The average pore sizes for S–NiO, D–NiO, and T–NiO are 18.24, 7.04, and 12.30 nm, respectively. The electrochemical measurements indicate that the D–NiO possesses the highest specific capacitance of 612.5 F g⁻¹ compared with S–NiO (432.2 F g⁻¹) and T–NiO (292.4 F g⁻¹) at 0.5 A g⁻¹ (2 mol L⁻¹ KOH). The D–NiO also exhibits good cyclic performance, with capacitance retention exceeding 90% after 1,000 cycles.

Using a facile, low-cost, and environment-friendly template method, Liu *et al.* [103] successfully prepared hierarchical mesoporous NiO nanoarrays (NiO– HMNAs). The synthesis process of NiO–HMNAs is shown in Fig. 4d. The edge length of NiO–HMNAs is 1.6 μ m (shown in Fig. 4e, f). The average thickness of NiO–HMNAs is ~10 nm (Fig. 4f, inset). As a battery-type electrode for hybrid SCs, the specific capacitance of NiO– HMNAs is 3114 F g⁻¹ at 5 mA cm⁻² (2 mol L⁻¹ KOH). Furthermore, the optimized hybrid SC device demonstrates a high energy density of 67.0 Wh kg⁻¹ at a power



Figure 4 (a) Schematic of the preparation of hierarchical NiO nanotube arrays on Ni foam. (b) SEM image of NiO nanotube arrays on Ni foam. (c) TEM image of NiO nanotube. (d) Schematic of the preparation of NiO-HMNAs on Cu foam. (e) and (f) SEM images of NiO-HMNAs. (g) Discharge curves of NiO nanotube arrays on Ni foam. (h) Cycling performance of the hybrid SC device based on NiO-HMNAs. Reproduced with permission from Ref. [101]. Copyright 2014, Elsevier. (d–f, h) Reproduced with permission from Ref. [103]. Copyright 2016, Elsevier.

density of 320 W kg⁻¹ and a good capacitance retention of 89.6% after 6,000 cycles (Fig. 4h). The ultrahigh specific capacitance of NiO-HMNAs is ascribed to the unique hierarchical mesoporous architecture.

Copper oxides

Copper oxide can be considered as another promising candidate for SCs because of its non-toxicity, abundance, and facile preparation [104,105]. Through a facile electrochemical process, 3D nanostructured CuO electrodes were prepared for SCs by Chen et al. (Fig. 5a, b) [106]. Due to its unique nanostructure, the as-prepared CuO nanoribbon-on-Ni-nanoporous/Ni foam (CNRNP) electrodes show excellent energy storage performance relative to a traditional electrode. Ni foam and flat Ni are also respectively used as substrate to fabricate general copper oxide samples. On the Ni foam, CuO nanoflakes (CNFNF) form a thick and uniform film, completely covering the Ni foam framework (Fig. 5c). On the flat Ni plate, the flake-like CuO (FLC) is formed (Fig. 5d). The specific capacitance of the CNRNP electrode is 800 F g⁻¹ at 200 mV s⁻¹ (3 mol L⁻¹ KOH), which retains 91% compared with that at 10 mV s⁻¹ (Fig. 5e, f). By contrast, the CNFNF and FLC electrodes deliver 81% and 69% of that at 10 mV s⁻¹, respectively. The symmetric triangular shape of charge–discharge curves indicates that the CNRNP possesses satisfactory pseudocapacitive behavior (Fig. 5g).

An easy and low-cost one-step surface oxidation process was applied by Zhao *et al.* [107] for the preparation of 3D flower-like CuO hierarchical structures grown on Cu foam. Given the innovative synthesis method and 3D connect/quasi-connect structures, this sample gains considerable attention as binder-free electrode material for SCs. The 3D flower-like CuO/Cu foam electrode could offer abundant active sites for redox reactions, effectively promote electrolyte penetration, enhance electronic conductivity, and shorten ion diffusion pathway. The specific capacitances of CuO are calculated to be 1641.4 and 1266.7 mF cm⁻² at 2 and 20 mA cm⁻² (5 mol L⁻¹ NaOH), respectively.

By an alkaline solution oxidation, Luo *et al.* [108] successfully synthesized CuO nanostructures with different surfactants (sodium dodecyl sulfate (SDS) and poly-

REVIEWS



Figure 5 (a) Schematic of the preparation of CNRNP electrode; SEM images of (b) CNRNP, (c) CNFNF, and (d) FLC; (e) CV curves of all samples at 10 mV s⁻¹; (f) specific capacitance of all samples at different scan rates; (g) charge-discharge curves of CNRNP. Reproduced with permission from Ref. [106]. Copyright 2014, the Royal Society of Chemistry.

vinyl alcohol (PVA)). The CuO electrode obtained with SDS shows superior electrochemical performance because of its ultrathin nanoleaves, which constitute a flower-shaped nanostructure, and possesses specific capacitances of 520 and 405 F g⁻¹ at 1 and 60 A g⁻¹ (1 mol L⁻¹ KOH), respectively, and a capacitance retention of 95.2% after 5,000 cycles at 1 A g⁻¹.

Bismuth oxides

Owing to abundant crystal morphologies and unique physical properties, Bi_2O_3 has attracted extensive attention in SC field [109]. Bi_2O_3 presents five main polymorphic forms (α -, β -, γ -, δ -, and ω - Bi_2O_3). Among these

forms, the high-temperature δ and low-temperature α phases are stable [110–112]. Gujar *et al.* first reported that Bi₂O₃ thin film, as positive electrode material for SCs, possessed a low specific capacitance of only 98 F g⁻¹ but exhibited high electrochemical reversibility [112].

Tong *et al.* [113] reported that hierarchical rippled Bi_2O_3 nanobelts were synthesized *via* an electrode-position method. The Bi_2O_3 nanobelts possess a width of 250–300 nm, a length of 1–5 µm, and a thickness of 10–30 nm. The intervals between the ripples are approximately 15–30 nm. The BET specific surface area of hierarchical Bi_2O_3 nanobelts sample (196 m² g⁻¹) is 8 times of that of Bi_2O_3 nanobelts sample with smooth surfaces (24 m² g⁻¹).

The specific capacitance of the hierarchical rippled Bi_2O_3 nanobelts is 250 F g⁻¹ at 100 mV s⁻¹ (1 mol L⁻¹ Na₂SO₄), which is remarkablely larger than the Bi_2O_3 nanobelts with smooth surfaces (61 F g⁻¹).

An easy one-step precipitation approach with the addition of diverse surfactants was used by Yuan's group for the synthesis of rod-like Bi_2O_3 [114]. The surfactants with various chain structures can effectively regulate and control the morphologies of Bi_2O_3 products. The Bi_2O_3 sample synthesized using P123 surfactant as electrode material was investigated. The sample exhibits a large specific capacitance of 1350 F g⁻¹ at 0.1 A g⁻¹ (6 mol L⁻¹ KOH), excellent rate performance (71.4% retention from 0.1 to 2 A g⁻¹), and an outstanding cycle performance (only 2.4% capacitance fade after 1,000 cycles).

Nickel cobalt oxides

Bimetallic oxides usually offer higher electrochemical activity than single metal oxides [115–117]. Nickel cobaltite exhibits excellent electrochemical performance because of richer redox reaction between nickel and cobalt ions [118]. A variety of nickel cobaltite materials with different morphologies, such as NPs [119], nanowires [120,121], urchin-like shape [122], and hollow spheres [123], have been studied as electrode materials for SCs.

To shorten the synthesis time, Xiao *et al.* [124] reported a template-free microwave-assisted heating reflux method to prepare 3D hierarchical flower-shaped NiCo₂ O_4 microspheres. The NiCo₂ O_4 microspheres are constituted of numerous flower-shaped nanostructures. The flower-shaped NiCo₂ O_4 microspheres demonstrate a high specific capacitance of 1006 F g⁻¹ at 1 A g⁻¹ (6 mol L⁻¹ KOH) and good cycle performance (retention of 93.2% after 1,000 cycles at 8 A g⁻¹).

The design and preparation of novel nanomaterials have gradually become the core research in optimizing pseudocapacitive performance. Li et al. [125] reported that the NiCo₂O₄ multiple hierarchical structures (MHSs) composed of two-dimensional (2D) nanosheets and onedimensional (1D) nanowires were directly anchored on Ni foam (Fig. 6a). First, the $NiCo_2O_4$ nanowires (NCO1) that uniformly covered the substrate were formed by a hydrothermal process followed by annealing treatment. After that, by a second hydrothermal process, the NCO1 was transformed into NiCo₂O₄ MHSs, which was named as NCO2. The nanowire was found to be superior over the high-dimensional nanosheet in the growth order; thereby effectively promoting the integration of these different nanostructures into the NiCo2O4 MHSs. As shown in Fig. 6b, c, the NiCo₂O₄ MHSs with diameters of about 4–6 μ m were obtained. All microspheres possess a 3D structure, in which the 2D nanosheets form the skeleton of microspheres, while the 1D nanowires surround the nanosheet. Given the favorable mesoporous architecture and large specific surface area, the sample NCO2 (NiCo₂O₄MHSs) shows the highest specific capacitance of 2623.3 F g⁻¹ at 1 A g⁻¹ (3 mol L⁻¹ KOH) (Fig. 6d). A capacity retention of 68% can be achieved from 1 A g⁻¹ to 40 A g⁻¹. The sample also displays good stability with 94% retention after 3,000 cycles at 10 A g⁻¹.

By a mild solution approach with polymeric nanotubes (PNT) as the template, Yu et al. [126] successfully fabricated hierarchical NiCoO2 nanotubes composed of nanosheets. Fig. 6e displays the SEM image of NiCoO₂ nanotubes obtained after calcination of the Ni-precursor@PNT composite at 400°C. As shown in Fig. 6f, the mesoporous NiCoO₂ nanosheet-nanotube structures possess hierarchical external construction and hollow internal structure with a diameter of approximately 100 nm. When tested at 2, 4, 8, 10, 20, and 40 A g^{-1} (2 mol L^{-1} KOH), the NiCoO₂ nanotube electrodes show high specific capacitances of 1468, 1352, 1233, 1178, 1020, and 672 F g^{-1} , respectively. At 10 A g^{-1} , the specific capacitance is 1178 F g^{-1} in the first cycle. The specific capacitance gradually decreases to 1168 F g⁻¹ after 3,000 cycles, resulting in only 0.8% loss of overall capacitance. Furthermore, the NiCoO₂ nanotubes show virtually 100% of the coulombic efficiency during the whole cycle (Fig. 6g). This excellent performance of the NiCoO₂ nanotubes is ascribed to the porous and hierarchical structures, which provide more effective contact areas between the active materials and electrolyte ions. Moreover, the wideopen ends of the NiCoO₂ nanotubes provide extra paths for the electrolyte.

Zinc vanadium oxides

Cao *et al.* [127] designed a simple and template-free approach to fabricate hierarchical nanospheres (NHNs) of ZnV_2O_4 . As shown in Fig. 7a, b, these nanospheres are composed of extremely thin nanosheets. Fig. 7c demonstrates the crystal geometry of spinel oxide ZnV_2O_4 . Fig. 7d shows that the specific capacitances of ZnV_2O_4 . Fig. 7d shows that the specific capacitances of ZnV_2O_4 . NHNs are 385, 360, 324, and 272 F g⁻¹ at current densities of 0.5, 1, 2, and 4 A g⁻¹, respectively. Furthermore, the ZnV_2O_4 NHNs electrode exhibits good cycle stability with 89% of capacity retention after 1,000 cycles at 1 A g⁻¹.

HIERARCHICALLY NANOSTRUCTURED COMPOSITES BASED ON TMOS FOR SCs

Multiphase composites based on TMOs could effectively



Figure 6 (a) Schematic of the preparation of NiCo₂O₄ MHSs; (b and c) FESEM images of the NiCo₂O₄ MHSs (NCO2) on Ni foam; (d) specific capacitance obtained from the discharge curves; (e) SEM image and (f) TEM image of the hierarchical NiCoO₂ nanosheets; (g) cycling performance of NiCoO₂ at 10 A g^{-1} . (a, d) Reproduced with permission from Ref. [125]. Copyright 2014, the American chemical Society. (e–g) Reproduced with permission from Ref. [126]. Copyright 2014, Elsevier.



Figure 7 (a and b) SEM images of ZnV_2O_4 NHNs; (c) crystal structure of spinel ZnV_2O_4 with corresponding atoms; (d) capacitance as a function of current density. Reproduced with permission from Ref. [127]. Copyright 2014, the American Chemical Society.

improve the specific capacitance and cycling performance of the devices compared with single-phase TMOs because of the complex chemical compositions and the synergetic effect of both individual components [128–135]. In the following section, four types of composites were introduced, namely: 1) composites of manganese oxides and other TMOs; 2) composites of gold NP-doped TMOs; 3) composites of carbon materials and TMOs; and 4) other forms of TMOs composites.

Composites of manganese oxides and other TMOs

Lee *et al.* [136] designed and synthesized binder-free 3D CoO@MnO₂ core-shell nanohybrids by using a facile method (shown in Fig. 8a). The 3D CoO@MnO₂ core-shell structure has a diameter of 268 nm (Fig. 8b). The 3D CoO@MnO₂ core-shell nanohybrid electrode delivers

REVIEWS



Figure 8 (a) Schematic of the preparation of 3D CoO@MnO₂ nanohybrid; (b) TEM image of the 3D CoO@MnO₂; (c) charge–discharge curves of the CoO@MnO₂; (d) cycle stabilities of the 3D CoO@MnO₂ core–shell nanohybrid and CoO NWs at 5 A g^{-1} . Reproduced with permission from Ref. [136]. Copyright 2017, the Royal Society of Chemistry.

good electrochemical performance with high specific capacitances (1835 and 1198 F g⁻¹ at 1 and 20 A g⁻¹) (6 mol L⁻¹ KOH) (Fig. 8c, d), and outstanding cycle performance (97.7% capacitance retention after 10,000 cycles at 1 A g⁻¹). When this 3D CoO@MnO₂ core-shell nanohybrid was used as cathode and assembled into an asymmetric SCs combined with a N-doped graphene anode, the formed asymmetric SCs device shows a high specific capacitance of 191 F g⁻¹ at 1 A g⁻¹ and good cycle performance with 86.8% retention after 10,000 cycles. The

device presents an energy density of about 85.9 W h kg⁻¹ at a power density of 852.4 W kg⁻¹.

Meng *et al.* [137] fabricated hierarchically densely packed porous MnO_2 microspheres doped with Fe_3O_4 NPs through a one-step low-cost ultrasound-assisted method. The SEM and TEM images (Fig. 9a, b) show that the sample owns a unique hierarchical nanostructure. The microsphere is composed of numerous randomly interconnected nanoflakes. The Fe_3O_4 -MnO₂ electrode shows a capacitance of 367.4 F g^{-1} at 100 mV s⁻¹ (1 mol L⁻¹

REVIEWS



Figure 9 (a) SEM and (b) TEM images of the Fe_3O_4 -MnO₂ sample; (c) capacitance retention at 5 A g⁻¹ over 5,000 cycles; (d, e) SEM images of the Co_3O_4 NAs (the inset shows TEM image of the Co_3O_4 NAs); (f, g) SEM and TEM images of $Co_3O_4@MnO_2$ NAs. (h) Charge-discharge curves of the $Co_3O_4@MnO_2$ composite. (i) Current density dependence of the specific capacitance of the MnO₂ nanosheets, Co_3O_4 NAs and $Co_3O_4@MnO_2$ NAs. (j, k) SEM and TEM images of $Cu_{0.27}Co_{2.73}O_4/MnO_2$; (l) the specific capacitances of the three electrodes as a function of current density. (a-c) Reproduced with permission from Ref. [137]. Copyright 2014, the American Chemical Society. (d-i) Reproduced with permission from Ref. [138]. Copyright 2014, Wiley-VCH. (j-l) Reproduced with permission from Ref. [139]. Copyright 2015, the Royal Society of Chemistry.

 Na_2SO_4). The capacitance retention of the Fe_3O_4 - MnO_2 composite is markedly superior to that of single MnO_2 (Fig. 9c). The good electrochemical performance of the

 Fe_3O_4 -MnO₂ sample is attributed to its unique hierarchical nanostructure, in which high-number-density and isolated Fe_3O_4 NPs are distributed in the interior of MnO₂.

Cheng et al. [138] fabricated a hierarchical porous Co₃O₄@MnO₂ nanoneedle arrays (Co₃O₄@MnO₂ NAs) on Ni foam via a hydrothermal method. The synthesis of Co₃O₄@MnO₂ NAs can be divided into four steps. First, through a modified hydrothermal process, Co(OH)₂CO₃ is directly grown on Ni foam substrate. Further heat treatment enables the formation of porous Co₃O₄ nanostructures. Afterward, the porous Co₃O₄ nanoneedles are coated with a thin carbon nanolayer. Finally, the Co₃O₄@MnO₂ NAs are obtained via the formation of MnO₂ nanosheets through a reaction between KMnO₄ and carbon. As shown in Fig. 9d, the Co_3O_4 nanoneedles stand on the Ni foam substrate. Each nanoneedle consists of numerous small NPs accumulating with each other, forming a nanoporous structure (shown in Fig. 9e). Fig. 9f, g show the SEM and TEM images of Co₃O₄@MnO₂ NAs. Thin MnO₂ nanosheets are covered on the surface of Co₃O₄ nanoneedles, forming a core-shell hierarchical nanostructure. The galvanostatic charge-discharge curves of the Co₃O₄@MnO₂ NAs investigated at 0.5–10 A g^{-1} (1 mol L^{-1} LiOH) are shown in Fig. 9h. The sample displays relatively high specific capacitances of 1905.4, 1693.2, 1396, 1253.4, 1062, 905.6, and 823 F g⁻¹ at 0.5, 1, 2, 3, 5, 8, and 10 A g^{-1} , respectively. Fig. 9i shows that the performance of the Co₃O₄@MnO₂ NAs is obviously better than those of the individual MnO₂ nanosheets and Co₃O₄ nanoneedles. Furthermore, the Co₃O₄@MnO₂ composite materials possess a high energy density of 66.2 W h kg⁻¹ at a power density of 0.25 kW kg⁻¹.

A hydrothermal and post-heat treatment method was employed by Yin et al. [139] for the preparation of hierarchical Cu_{0.27}Co_{2.73}O₄/MnO₂ nanorod arrays. The MnO₂ nanoflakes homogeneously grow on Cu_{0.27}Co_{2.73}O₄ nanorods which are grown on Ni foam, and the average diameter of the composites is approximately 250-300 nm (shown in Fig. 9j, k). The specific capacitances of $Cu_{0.27}$ $Co_{2.73}O_4$ and $Cu_{0.27}Co_{2.73}O_4/MnO_2$ are 2.24 F cm⁻² at 17.6 mA cm⁻² and 3.1 F cm⁻² at 24.8 mA cm⁻², respectively (Fig. 91). The specific capacitance of Co_3O_4 at 16.4 mA cm⁻² is 1.67 F cm⁻², which is markedly lower than those of Cu_{0.27}Co_{2.73}O₄ and Cu_{0.27}Co_{2.73}O₄/MnO₂ electrodes. As the current density increases from 2.2 to 17.6 mA cm⁻², the capacity of $Cu_{0.27}Co_{2.73}O_4$ remains at ~82.1%. For $Cu_{0.27}Co_{2.73}O_4/MnO_2$, a better rate capability with approximately 91.2% capacitance retention can be observed as the current density increases from 3.1 to 24.8 mA cm⁻². The homogeneously aligned structure of Cu_{0.27}Co_{2.73}O₄ nanorods with planar tips and a rough surface can effectively control the aggregation of active

materials and shorten the pathway for ion transportation, further resulting in large areal capacitance and superior rate capability. These results demonstrate the opportunity of the potential candidate as binder-free electrodes applied in SCs and show great potential in exploring higher areal capacitance for miniaturized devices.

Liu et al. [140] prepared hierarchical NiCo₂O₄@MnO₂ core-shell nanosheet array composites on Ni foam by a two-step hydrothermal method. Owing to the unique nanoarchitecture, the NiCo2O4@MnO2 core-shell nanosheet arrays display a high areal capacitance of 2.39 F cm⁻², (1595.1 F g⁻¹) at 3 mA cm⁻² (1 mol L⁻¹ NaOH). However, the areal capacitance of pure NiCo₂O₄ nanosheet arrays was calculated to be only 1.50 F cm⁻² at 3 mA cm⁻². The NiCo₂O₄@MnO₂ sample also exhibits good cycle performance (92.6% retention after 2000 cycles at 40 mA cm⁻²), which is superior to that of the pristine NiCo₂O₄ nanosheet sample. The results show that the growth of MnO₂ nanosheets on NiCo₂O₄ nanosheets is a viable approach to increase the capacitive properties of materials and simultaneously improve the cycling performance of SCs.

By a facile two-step electro-deposition process, Zhang *et al.* [141] successfully synthesized a 3D hierarchical NiCo₂O₄@MnO₂ hybrid nanomaterial grown on stainless steel mesh. The specific capacitance of NiCo₂O₄@MnO₂ at 2 A g⁻¹ is 688.4 F g⁻¹, which is markedly higher than those of MnO₂ (336.6 F g⁻¹) and NiCo₂O₄ (241 F g⁻¹). The NiCo₂O₄@MnO₂ shows a high specific capacitance of 913.6 F g⁻¹ at 0.5 A g⁻¹ and a capacitance retention of 87.1% after 3,000 cycles. Furthermore, the asymmetric SCs device with a large voltage window of 1.5 V is assembled by using NiCo₂O₄@MnO₂ sample as the cathode and activated carbon as the anode. The device achieves an energy density of 37.5 W hg⁻¹.

Composites of gold NP-doped TMOs

TMOs doped with Au NPs are highly active and function as selective catalysts for a variety of chemical reactions [142,143]. The design of the TMOs composites with Au nanoparticles is demonstrated to be another efficient approach to enhance the electrochemical performance of TMOs as SC electrodes [144]. Wang *et al.* [145] designed and synthesized an Au–NiO composite that exhibited a markedly improved rate performance on SCs. The specific capacitance of the Au–NiO electrode at 20 A g⁻¹ is 619 F g⁻¹, which is markedly higher than that of pure NiO electrode (216 F g⁻¹).

You et al. [146] successfully synthesized mono-



Figure 10 (a) Schematic illustration for the fabrication of hierarchical ZnO@Au@NiO nanocomposite; (b) SEM images of ZnO@Au@NiO; (c) CV curves of two samples; (d) discharge curves of two samples; (e and f) energy level diagrams at the interface of ZnO-Au-NiO during charge-discharge process. Reproduced with permission from Ref. [151]. Copyright 2015, the American Chemical Society.

dispersed dumbbell-like Au–Fe₃O₄ NPs with different sizes (5/14, 5/21, 7/14, and 7/21 nm Au–Fe₃O₄ NPs). The specific capacitance of 7/14 nm Au–Fe₃O₄ NPs at 1 A g⁻¹ is 464 F g⁻¹ (1 mol L⁻¹ KOH), which is markedly higher than that of pure Fe₃O₄ NPs (160 F g⁻¹). The 7/14 nm Au–Fe₃O₄ composite exhibits a higher capacitance retention of 86.4% after 1,000 cycles at 10 A g⁻¹ than that of pure Fe₃O₄ NP electrode (72.8% retention of initial capacitance). The above capacitive enhancement can be ascribed to the electron transfer increase induced by gold across the dumbbell-like NPs.

A simple and controllable electrochemical deposition process was employed by Hu's groups to synthesize the 3D hierarchical heterostructure of MnO₂ nanosheets and nanorods directly grown on porous Au-coated Co3O4 nanowall array, and to assemble a sandwich construction of Co₃O₄@Au@MnO₂ [147]. Owing to the unique sandwich construction, each component is efficiently used for energy reaction. The specific capacitance of the Co₃O₄@ Au@MnO₂ nanosheet hierarchical heterostructures (Co₃ $O_4@Au@MnO_2$ (NSs) HHs) is 1532.4 F g⁻¹ at 1 A g⁻¹ (1 mol L^{-1} LiOH), which is higher than those of the Aucoated Co_3O_4 nanowall arrays (1046.6 F g⁻¹) and Co_3 O4@Au@MnO2 nanorod hierarchical heterostructures (Co₃O₄@Au@MnO₂ (NRs) HHs) (1292.9 F g⁻¹). The Co₃ O₄@Au@MnO₂ (NSs) HHs also exhibit superior cycling performance (with virtually no degradation after 5,000

cycles). Furthermore, the presented results of the Co₃ $O_4@Au@MnO_2$ (NSs) HHs are larger than those of the reported Co₃O₄ or MnO₂-based heterostructures, such as MnO₂/Mn/MnO₂ nanotube arrays (937 F g⁻¹ at 1.5 A g⁻¹) [148], Zn₂SO₄@MnO₂ nanorods (642.3 F g⁻¹ at 1 A g⁻¹) [149], and Co₃O₄/NiO nanowire arrays (853 F g⁻¹ at 2 A g⁻¹) [150]. Thus, the Co₃O₄@Au@MnO₂ (NSs) HHs could be recognized as promising materials for SCs.

Yan et al. [151] designed and synthesized a hierarchical ZnO@Au@NiO nanocomposite as the electrode of SCs (Fig. 10a,b). First, ZnO nanowires arrays were grown on carbon nanofibers of carbon cloth. Then, a small quantity of Au nanoparticles was covered on ZnO nanowires. Subsequently, NiO nanosheets were uniformly grown on the surface of the Au-modified ZnO nanowires to obtain the ZnO@Au@NiO composites. The ZnO/Au/ NiO electrode possesses a larger area in the CV curve, suggesting superior electrochemical performance to that of ZnO/NiO nanorods (shown in Fig. 10c). The areal capacitance of the ZnO@Au@NiO nanocomposite is calculated to be 3.50 F cm^{-2} at 2 mA cm^{-2} (1 mol L⁻¹ KOH), whereas the ZnO@NiO electrode only shows an areal capacitance of 0.42 F cm⁻² under the same condition (Fig. 10d). The ZnO@Au@NiO nanocomposite electrode demonstrates good cyclic stability with approximately 80.3% capacitance retention after 4,000 continuous cycles at 30 mA cm⁻². The enhanced electrochemical property is

mainly ascribed to the decoration of Au nanoparticles. On one hand, Au nanoparticles can accelerate electron conduction. On the other hand, electrons can be temporarily trapped and accumulated at the Fermi level (E_F) due to the localized Schottky barrier at Au/NiO interface during charge process until filling the gap between ZnO and NiO (Fig. 10e) [151]. Thus, more electrons can be released during discharge process (Fig. 10f).

Composites of carbon materials and TMOs

For pseudocapacitors, surface oxidation-reduction reaction of metal oxides can result in higher specific capacitances [152]. Nanostructured carbon materials are generally utilized as EDLC electrodes, demonstrating their superior long-term electrochemical stability [153]. Thus, considerable efforts have been made to enhance the SC performance by creating composites of TMOs and carbon materials, such as TMOs/graphene and TMOs/ carbon nanofibers (CFs) [154–167]. The synthesized multi-component composites can maximize the benefits from all components [154–169].

Wang et al. [170] designed and fabricated two types of hierarchical core-shell fiber-based electrodes, including MnO₂/reduced graphene oxide (RGO)/CF and 3D porous graphene hydrogel-wrapped Cu wire (GH/CW). The specific areal capacitance and volumetric capacitance of the $MnO_2/RGO/CF$ electrode are 205.7 mF cm⁻² and 13.7 $F \text{ cm}^{-3}$ at 0.5 mA cm⁻² (1 mol L⁻¹ Na₂SO₄), respectively, and both values are considerably larger than those of MnO₂/CF (178.3 mF cm⁻² and 11.8 F cm⁻³) and RGO/CF $(1.6 \text{ mF cm}^{-3} \text{ and } 0.1 \text{ F cm}^{-3})$. The results indicate that the synergistic effect and the interactions between the RGO nanosheets and MnO₂ nanoflakes in the MnO₂/ RGO/CF electrode markedly increase the total capacitive performance. The specific capacitance of the MnO₂/RGO/ CF electrode remains at 73% from 13.7 to 10 F cm⁻³. Owing to the synergistic effects of different components in nanohybrid fiber electrodes, the asymmetric SC device with MnO₂/graphene/CF as the cathode and GH/CW as the anode shows a high areal energy density of 18.1 μ W h cm⁻² and a volumetric energy density of 0.9 mW h cm⁻³ in a voltage range of 0–1.6 V. Moreover, the asymmetric SC also shows an energy density as high as $0.63 \text{ mW} \text{ h cm}^{-3}$ at a high power density of 0.2 W cm^{-3} . Thus, the fiber-based flexible SCs show excellent flexibility, great rate capability, and good cycle stability, making these SCs a prospective power source for flexible energy storage devices.

Yu *et al.* [171] fabricated hierarchical graphene/MnO₂ nanostructured sponges by a low-cost "dip and dry"

process with commercial sponges as skeletons. The composite can be operated at a high scan rate of 200 V s⁻¹ and has superior cycle performance (~90% retention after 10,000 cycles at 10 A g⁻¹). As calculated using galvano-static charge–discharge curves, the highest energy density and power density of sponge@RGO@MnO₂ based device are 8.34 W h kg⁻¹ and 47 kW kg⁻¹, respectively, at an operating voltage of 0.8 V. However, the highest energy density and power density are 2.08 W h kg⁻¹ and 94 kW kg⁻¹ for the sponge@RGO under the same condition. The features of low cost, facile preparation, wide operation range, high specific capacitance, high energy and power density, and superior cycling performance could make the as-fabricated SCs as promising devices for commercial production.

Kumar *et al.* [172] reported an interesting work about the fabrication of 3D hierarchical structure composed of 0D Co₃O₄ nanobeads, 1D carbon nanotubes (CNTs), and 2D graphenes (GNSs) *via* an easy ultrafast microwave irradiation method for high performance supercapacitor electrode. In this unique structure, Co₃O₄ nanobeads are anchored on CNTs and the CNTs are grown on GNSs, leading to a good electrochemical performance. The electrode possesses a large specific capacitance of 600 F g⁻¹ at 0.7 A g⁻¹ (30 wt.% KOH). Furthermore, the electrode also exhibits good cycle stability (94.5% retention after 5,000 cycles at 10 A g⁻¹).

Flexible solid-state fiber SCs present the advantages of light weight, high power density, good flexibility, low cost, and environmental friendliness. Zhang et al. [173] fabricated a MnO₂/CFs fiber via electrodepositing ultrathin MnO₂ nanosheets on carbon fiber yarns. The specific volumetric and gravimetric capacitances of the single MnO₂/CFs fiber electrode are calculated to be 58.7 F cm⁻³ and 428 F g⁻¹ based on the mass of MnO₂. The MnO₂/CFs electrode demonstrates a large volumetric capacitance because of the synergistic effects of MnO₂ and CFs. The assembled flexible solid-state fiber-like SCs (two MnO₂/ CFs fiber electrodes as anode and cathode, resepectively) show a high volumetric energy density (3.8 mW h cm⁻³ at a power density of 89 mW cm⁻³), superior flexibility (CV curves are almost unaltered after 2,000 bending times), and an excellent cycling performance (only 14.2% capacitance fade after 10,000 cycles).

By a hydrothermal method, Hu *et al.* [174] fabricated a hierarchical mesoporous NiFe₂O₄ (NFO) nanocone forest that directly grew on carbon textile (CT). In the NFO-CT sample, the compact bundle of fibers possesses an average diameter of approximately 5 μ m. The BET specific surface area of the hierarchical NFO-CT is as



Figure 11 (a) SEM and (b) TEM images of ZnO NR@NiO/MOO₂ CNSAs; (c) the areal specific capacitances of the two electrodes as a function of current density; (d) SEM image of $MnMoO_4/CoMoO_4$ heterostructured nanowires; (e) TEM image at the heterojunction of the hierarchical $MnMoO_4/CoMoO_4$ heterostructured nanowires; (f) cycling performance of $MnMoO_4/CoMoO_4$ (3D) electrodes tested at 3 and 20 A g⁻¹ (the inset shows charge-discharge curves cycled at the first and last five cycles at 3 A g⁻¹). (a-c) Reproduced with permission from Ref. [176]. Copyright 2014, the American Chemical Society. (d-f) Reproduced with permission from Ref. [177]. Copyright 2011, Nature Publishing Group.

high as 593.60 m² g⁻¹. As a binder-free electrode, the NFO–CT exhibits specific capacitances of 697, 543.5, 421.8, 355.2, and 303 F g⁻¹ at 5, 10, 25, 50, and 75 mV s⁻¹ (6 mol L⁻¹ LiCl), respectively. Furthermore, the symmetric solid-state SCs device based on NFO–CT demonstrates high capacitance (584 F g⁻¹ at 5 mV s⁻¹) and excellent cycle performance (93.57% capacitance retention after 10,000 cycles). The energy density is calculated to be 54.9 W h kg⁻¹ at a power density of 300 W kg⁻¹. Even at 1372 W kg⁻¹, the NFO–CT electrode still achieves an energy density of 25.5 W h kg⁻¹, which is substantially higher than those of single/binary metal oxide-based electrodes.

An easy, low-cost, and controllable approach was used by Zhang *et al.* [175] for the synthesis of corrugated NiCo₂O₄ nanosheets on a nitrogen-doped graphene/carbon nanotube (NGN/CNT) film. The NiCo₂O₄/NGN/ CNT film electrode possesses a high volumetric capacitance of 482.7 F cm⁻³ and a gravimetric capacitance of 2292.7 F g⁻¹ at 5 A g⁻¹ (6 mol L⁻¹ KOH). The electrode also exhibits high rate capability and extremely long-term cycle stability. The asymmetric SCs device was fabricated by using NiCo₂O₄/NGN/CNTs as the cathode and NGN/ CNTs as the anode. The device exhibits a high gravimetric energy density of 42.71 W h kg⁻¹ at 775 W kg⁻¹ and a high gravimetric power density of 15485 W kg⁻¹ at 24.69 W h kg⁻¹. Thus, this material is better than commercially available $Ni(OH)_2$ used in Ni-MH battery on power density.

Other forms of TMOs composites

Via a two-step solution-based approach, Duan et al. [176] synthesized a hierarchical core-shell structure of ZnO nanorod@NiO/MoO2 composite nanosheet arrays (ZnO NR@NiO/MoO2 CNSAs) on a Ni foam substrate. As shown in Fig. 11a, the ZnO NR@NiO/MoO₂ CNSAs possess a diameter of ~ 600 nm and length of $\sim 4 \mu m$. The nanorod consists of a ZnO NR "core" and a NiO/MoO₂ CNS "shell", and the ZnO NRs are well wrapped with ultrathin NiO/MoO₂ CNSs (shown in Fig. 11b). The unique structure favors the penetration of electrolytes into the interior of the active material. The areal specific capacitance of the ZnO NR@NiO/MoO2 CNSAs is 1.18 F cm⁻² at 5 mA cm⁻² (2 mol L⁻¹ KOH) (shown in Fig. 11c). Moreover, the material also shows a good cycling performance (only 8.3% loss after 4,000 cycles at 10 mA cm⁻²).

Mai *et al.* [177] synthesized a 3D hierarchical $MnMoO_4/CoMoO_4$ heterostructure by a refluxing approach under mild conditions and $MnMoO_4$ as the backbone material. Fig. 11d shows the morphology and structure of the $MnMoO_4/CoMoO_4$ hierarchical heterostructure. The pure $MnMoO_4$ nanowire backbone materials are approximately 10 µm in length and 500 nm in

diameter. Furthermore, as shown in Fig. 11e, the Co-MoO₄ nanorods with diameters of around 50 nm are obtained. The BET specific surface areas of MnMoO₄, $MnMoO_4/CoMoO_4$ nanocomposite, and surface-modified MnMoO₄/CoMoO₄ are 3.17, 28.0, and 54.06 m² g⁻¹, respectively. The active sites of the electrode can be adequately accessed due to the larger surface area compared with that in a previous report [178] (15 and 25 m² g⁻¹, which correspond to MnMoO₄ nanorods and CoMoO₄ (Fig. 1 shigher hierarchical MnMoO₄/CoMoO₄ heterostructured nanowires is 187.1 F g⁻¹ at 1 A g⁻¹ (2 mol L⁻¹ NaOH), which is

evidently higher than those of pure 1D nanorod MnMoO₄ (9.7 F g⁻¹), CoMoO₄ (62.8 F g⁻¹), and the MnMoO₄/Co-MoO₄ nanocomposite (69.2 F g⁻¹). Fig. 11f displays excellent reversibility of the hierarchical MnMoO₄/CoMoO₄ electrode with high cycling efficiency of up to 98% after 1,000 cycles.

Through a stepwise hydrothermal method, Mai et al. [179] designed and synthesized 3D self-supported Co₃ O4@CoMoO4 core-shell architectures that directly grew on Ni foam. The Co₃O₄@CoMoO₄ shows a high capacitance of 1902 F g^{-1} at 1 A g^{-1} and good cycling stability with 1% capacitance loss after 5,000 cycles at 5 A g^{-1} (2 mol L⁻¹ KOH). The asymmetric SCs device was fabricated by using Co₃O₄@CoMoO₄ as the cathode and the CNTs on Ni foam as the anode. The device delivers a high energy density of 45.2 W h kg⁻¹ at a power density of 400 W kg⁻¹ and good cycling performance (capacitance retention of 98.5% after 3,000 cycles at 0.5 Ag^{-1}). The good electrochemical performance of Co₃O₄@CoMoO₄ is ascribed to the unique architecture with a large interfacial area and numerous channels for the rapid diffusion of electrolyte ions.

High areal specific capacitance per area is of great importance for the practical application of supercapacitors. To realize this goal, it need to combine high mass-loading of the active material and high utilization ratio of the material. Sun et al. [180] prepared a ternary hierarchical core-shell structure of Co₃O₄@Ni-Co-O arrays via an easy and cost-effective strategy (Fig. 12a-c). As shown in Fig. 12a, the Co₃O₄ microsheet grown on foam Ni substrate is the core, and the aligned slim Ni-Co-O nanorods (diameter <20 nm) are coated on it. This structure exhibits an excellent electrochemical performance when utilized as a supercapacitor electrode. The electrode with a high areal mass-loading of 12 mg cm⁻² possesses a high specific capacitance of 2098 F g⁻¹ at 5 mA cm⁻² (1 mol L⁻¹ KOH) (Fig. 12d). Furthermore, Sun et al. [181] also fabricated a hierarchical core-shell structure of Co₃O₄@NiO nanowire@nanorod arrays via a similar strategy (Fig. 12e). The NiO nanorods were in-situ grown on the surface of Co₃O₄ nanowire arrays grown on foam Ni substrate (Fig. 12f-i). The electrode with a high mass-loading of 19.5 mg cm⁻¹ delivers a high specific capacitance of 2033 F g^{-1} at 5 mA cm⁻² (1 mol L⁻¹ KOH). The areal capacitance is up to 39.6 F cm^{-2} , which is much higher than that of pure Co_3O_4 electrode (6.7 F cm⁻²) (Fig. 12j, k). The excellent performance of these core-shell structure arrays is mainly attributed to the special hierarchical structure and the synergistic effect of different components. Based on the above two works, Sun et al. [182] further prepared hierarchical $Co_x Fe_{3-x}O_4$ arrays directly grown on Cu foam. Combining the above hierarchical Co₃O₄@Ni-Co-O arrays as the cathode, an aqueous battery was assembled. The battery shows an energy density of ~2.08 mW h cm⁻² at a power density of ~4.89 mW cm⁻², and an energy density of ~1.36 mW h cm⁻² at a power density of ~42.56 mW cm⁻² (6 mol L⁻¹ KOH). This indicates that hierarchically nanostructured metal oxides also have potential applications in the field of aqueous battery [182].

Iron oxides have been considered to be promising anode materials for supercapacitors due to their low cost, abundance, non-toxicity, and functionality in negative potentials [183–185]. Recently, Lin and co-workers [183] prepared a hierarchical Fe₂O₃ nanotube array directly grown on Ni foam *via* chemical transformation of ZnO nanowire. The characterization results show that the walls of nanotube are mainly composed of α -Fe₂O₃ nanoparticles mixed with a small quantity of ZnO nanoparticles. The electrochemical test results indicate that the hierarchical structure electrode exhibits a high reversible capacitance of 300.1 F g⁻¹ at 0.75 A g⁻¹ (1 mol L⁻¹ Li₂SO₄).

A comparison of typical hierarchically nanostructured TMOs for SCs is given in Table 1. The morphologies and structures of TMOs are important influential factors for the corresponding electrochemical performance. Moreover, the performance of the reported asymmetric supercapacitors is summarized in Table 2.

CONCLUSIONS AND OUTLOOKS

In this review, we summarized the recent progress in the field of hierarchically nanostructured TMOs for SCs. Hierarchically nanostructured TMOs with various structures and compositions have been fabricated *via* different synthesis methods. The primary structure mainly includes spheres, hollow spheres, rods, and tubes at micrometer scale or sub-micrometer scale. The secondary structure is mainly a 2D nanosheet, which is not only

REVIEWS



Figure 12 (a) Schematic image for the design of hierarchical core-shell $Co_3O_4@Ni-Co-O$ nanoarray (the Co_3O_4 nanosheet is shown in pink and the Ni-Co-O nanoord is shown in green); (b, c) SEM and TEM images of the hierarchical $Co_3O_4@Ni-Co-O$ arrays; (d) galvanostatic discharge curves of the hierarchical $Co_3O_4@Ni-Co-O$ arrays at various current densities; (e) schematic image for the design of hierarchical core-shell $Co_3O_4@Ni-Co-O$ arrays; (d) galvanostatic discharge curves of the hierarchical $Co_3O_4@Ni-Co-O$ arrays at various current densities; (e) schematic image for the design of hierarchical core-shell $Co_3O_4@NiO$ arrays (in this work, three samples were fabricated by adding 1, 2, and 3 mmol Ni(NO₃)₂·6H₂O during the synthesis process. These three samples were denoted as NWRAs-1, NWRAs-2, and NWRAs-3, respectively. Co_3O_4 nanowire arrays sample was denoted as NWAs); (f, g) SEM images of NWRAs-3 at different magnifications; (h, i) TEM and EDS mapping images of NWRAs-3; (j) galvanostatic charge and discharge curves at 10 mA cm⁻²; (k) plots of areal specific capacitance *versus* current density. (a–d) Reproduced with permission from Ref. [180]. Copyright 2012, Springer. (e–k) Reproduced with permission from Ref. [181]. Copyright 2014, Elsevier.

beneficial to the stability of the hierarchical structure but also conducive to electrochemical reaction. Single-metal oxides, bimetallic oxides, the composites of different metal oxides, and the composites of metal oxides with carbon nanomaterials or noble metal NPs have been studied extensively for the compositions of hierarchically nanostructured TMOs. In general, bimetallic oxides or composites with different metal oxides exhibit higher electrochemical activities compared with single-metal oxides because of the complex chemical compositions and the synergetic effect of the individual components.

For further improvement in the performance of SCs, the development of new types of hierarchically nanostructured TMO materials would become the focus of future research. The details can be listed as follows: (1) The incorporation of TMO materials with various nanostructured carbon materials, such as CNTs, CFs, and graphene, can not only inherit the 1D or 2D structures of these carbon materials but also can effectively improve the electrical conductivity of the TMOs. The synthesized

REVIEWS

Materials	SSA^{a} (m ² g ⁻¹)	Electrolyte	Capacitance/current density	Retention (%)/cycles/current density	Ref.
Flower-like a-MnO ₂	216	$1 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ K}_2 \text{SO}_4$	$298 \text{ Fg}^{-1} / 0.117 \text{ Ag}^{-1}$	90/2000/2 A g ⁻¹	[76]
α -MnO ₂ microspheres	/	$1 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ Na}_2 \text{SO}_4$	$365 \text{ F g}^{-1} / 2 \text{ A g}^{-1}$	$100/2000/2 \text{ Ag}^{-1}$	[77]
β -MnO ₂ nanoflowers	267	$1 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ Na}_2 \text{SO}_4$	296.3 F g^{-1} /2 mV s^{-1}	/	[78]
MnO ₂ NFs ^b	269	$1 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ Na}_2 \text{SO}_4$	$176 \text{ F g}^{-1} / 20 \text{ A g}^{-1}$	$100/2000/2 \text{ Ag}^{-1}$	[79]
δ -MnO ₂ microspheres	238	$1 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ Na}_2 \text{SO}_4$	$364 \text{ F g}^{-1} / 1 \text{ A g}^{-1}$	$100/6000/10 \text{ Ag}^{-1}$	[80]
Co ₃ O ₄ film	/	$2 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ KOH}$	$352 \text{ F g}^{-1} / 2 \text{ A g}^{-1}$	/	[91]
Enoki mushroom-like Co ₃ O ₄	/	$6 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ KOH}$	$787 \text{ F g}^{-1} / 1 \text{ A g}^{-1}$	94.5/1000/10 A g ⁻¹	[92]
HFC Co ₃ O ₄ ^c	245.5	$2 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ KOH}$	948.9 F g ⁻¹ /1 A g ⁻¹	/	[93]
NiO NWs ^d	/	$6 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ KOH}$	1493 F g^{-1} /3 A g^{-1}	87/2000/50 mV s ⁻¹	[100]
NiO NTAs ^e	165	$1 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ Na}_2 \text{SO}_4$	$675 \text{ F g}^{-1} / 2 \text{ A g}^{-1}$	93.2/10000/2 A g ⁻¹	[101]
D-NiO ^f	92.99	$2 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ KOH}$	$612.5 \text{ F g}^{-1} / 0.5 \text{ A g}^{-1}$	90/1000/0.5 A g ⁻¹	[102]
NiO-HMNAs ^g	312.6	$2 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ KOH}$	3114 F g^{-1} /5 mA cm ⁻²	87.6/4000/30 mA cm ⁻²	[103]
$\mathrm{CNRNP}^{\mathrm{h}}$	/	$3 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ KOH}$	$800 \text{ F g}^{-1} / 200 \text{ mV s}^{-1}$	/	[106]
Flower-like CuO	/	$5 \text{ mol } L^{-1}NaOH$	$1641 \text{ mF cm}^{-2} / 2 \text{ mA cm}^{-2}$	$79/10000/4 \text{ mA cm}^{-2}$	[107]
Flower-shaped CuO	119.6	1 mol L^{-1} KOH	520 F g^{-1} /1 A g^{-1}	95.2/5000/1 A g ⁻¹	[108]
Bi ₂ O ₃ NBs ⁱ	196	$1 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ Na}_2 \text{SO}_4$	$250 \text{ F g}^{-1} / 100 \text{ mV s}^{-1}$	$100/1000/100 \text{ mV s}^{-1}$	[113]
Rod-like Bi ₂ O ₃	/	$6 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ KOH}$	1350 F g^{-1} /0.1 A g^{-1}	97.6/1000/0.1 A g ⁻¹	[114]
NiCo ₂ O ₄ microspheres	148.5	$6 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ KOH}$	$1006 \text{ F g}^{-1} / 1 \text{ A g}^{-1}$	93.2/1000/8 A g ⁻¹	[124]
NiCo ₂ O ₄ MHSs ^j	118.3	$3 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ KOH}$	$2623 \text{ F g}^{-1} / 1 \text{ A g}^{-1}$	99.2/3000/10 A g ⁻¹	[125]
NiCoO ₂ NTs ^k	98.9	$2 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ KOH}$	1468 F g^{-1} /2 A g^{-1}	99.2/3000/10 A g ⁻¹	[126]
ZnV ₂ O ₄ NHNs ¹	/	$2 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ KOH}$	$385 \text{ F g}^{-1} / 0.5 \text{ A g}^{-1}$	89/1000/1 A g ⁻¹	[127]
CoO@MnO ₂ core-shell	154.95	$6 \text{ mol L}^{-1} \text{ KOH}$	$1835 \text{ F g}^{-1} / 1 \text{ A g}^{-1}$	97.7/10000/1 A g ⁻¹	[136]
Fe ₃ O ₄ -MnO ₂ microspheres	/	$1 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ Na}_2 \text{SO}_4$	$367.4 \text{ F g}^{-1} / 100 \text{ mV s}^{-1}$	76/5000/5 A g^{-1}	[137]
Co ₃ O ₄ @MnO ₂ NAs ^m	/	$1 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ LiOH}$	1905.4 F g^{-1} /0.5 A g^{-1}	89.8/5000/2 A g ⁻¹	[138]
Cu _{0.27} Co _{2.73} O ₄ /MnO ₂ NRAs ⁿ	/	$6 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ KOH}$	3.1 F cm^{-2} /24.8 mA cm $^{-2}$	/	[139]
NiCo ₂ O ₄ @MnO ₂ core-shell	75.06	$1 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ NaOH}$	1595.1 F g^{-1} /3 mA cm ⁻²	92.6/2000/40 mA cm ⁻²	[140]
NiCo ₂ O ₄ @MnO ₂ nanosheets	/	1 mol L^{-1} KOH	913.6 F g^{-1} /0.5 A g^{-1}	87.1/3000/0.5 A g ⁻¹	[141]
Dumbbell-like Au-Fe ₃ O ₄	/	$1 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ KOH}$	$464 \text{ F g}^{-1} / 1 \text{ A g}^{-1}$	86.4/1000/10 A g ⁻¹	[146]
Co ₃ O ₄ @Au@MnO ₂ (NSs)HHs ^o	/	$1 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ LiOH}$	1532.4 F g^{-1} /1 A g^{-1}	115/5000/10 A g ⁻¹	[147]
ZnO@Au@NiO	/	$1 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ KOH}$	$3.5 \text{ F cm}^{-2} / 2 \text{ mA cm}^{-2}$	80.3/4000/30 mA cm ⁻²	[151]
MnO ₂ /RGO/CF ^p	/	$1 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ Na}_2 \text{SO}_4$	13.7 F cm^{-3} /0.5 mA cm $^{-2}$	/	[170]
3D Co ₃ O ₄ -nb@CG ^q	/	30 wt.% KOH	600.19 F g^{-1} /0.7 A g^{-1}	95.4/5000/1.1 A g ⁻¹	[172]
NiFe ₂ O ₄ -CT ^r	/	$6 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ LiCl}$	697 F $g^{-1}/5 \text{ mV s}^{-1}$	/	[174]
NiCo ₂ O ₄ /NGN/CNTs ^s	/	$6 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ KOH}$	2292.7 F g ⁻¹ /5 A g ⁻¹	$125/10000/30 \text{ A g}^{-1}$	[175]
ZnO NR@NiO/MoO2 CNSAst	/	$2 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ KOH}$	$1.18 \text{ F cm}^{-2}/5 \text{ mA cm}^{-2}$	91.7/4000/10 mA cm ⁻²	[176]
MnMoO ₄ /CoMoO ₄ nanowires	54.06	$2 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ NaOH}$	187.1 F g^{-1} /1 A g^{-1}	98/1000/20 A g ⁻¹	[177]
Co ₃ O ₄ @CoMoO ₄ core-shell	61.4	$2 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ KOH}$	1902 F g^{-1} /1 A g^{-1}	99/5000/5 A g ⁻¹	[179]
Co ₃ O ₄ @Ni-Co-O NSRAs ^u	31.1	$1 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ KOH}$	$2098 \text{ F g}^{-1}/5 \text{ mA cm}^{-2}$	96/1000/30 mA cm ⁻²	[180]
Co ₃ O ₄ @NiO NWRAs ^v	116	$1 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ KOH}$	$2033 \text{ F g}^{-1}/5 \text{ mA cm}^{-2}$	100/1000/30 mA cm ⁻²	[181]
α -Fe ₂ O ₃ nanotubes	/	$1 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ Li}_2 SO_4$	$300.1 \text{ F g}^{-1}/0.75 \text{ A g}^{-1}$	/	[183]

Table 1 Comparison of typical hierarchically nanostructured TMOs as electrodes of SCs in three-electrode systems

a) SSA: specific surface area. b) $MnO_2 NFs: MnO_2 nanoflakes; c) HFC Co_3O_4$: hollow fluffy cages Co_3O_4 ; d) NiO NWs: NiO nanowires; e) NiO NTAs: NiO nanotube arrays; f) D-NiO: double-shelled NiO; g) NiO-HMNAs: hierarchical mesoporous NiO nanoarrays; h) CNRNP: CuO nanoribbon-on-Ni-nanoporous/Ni foam; i) Bi₂O₃ NBs: Bi₂O₃ nanobelts; j) NiCo₂O₄ MHSs: NiCo₂O₄ multiple hierarchical structures; k) NiCo₂O₂ NTs: NiCo₂ nanotube; l) ZnV₂O₄ NHNs: ZnV₂O₄ novel hierarchical nanospheres; m) Co₃O₄@MnO₂ NAs: Co₃O₄@MnO₂ nanoneedle arrays; n) Cu_{0.27}Co_{2.73}O₄/MnO₂ NRAs: Cu_{0.27}Co_{2.73}O₄/MnO₂ nanorod arrays; o) Co₃O₄@Au@MnO₂ (NSs) HHs: Co₃O₄@Au@MnO₂ nanosheet hierarchical heterostructures; p) MnO₂/RGO/CF: MnO₂/reduced graphene oxide/carbon nanofiber; q) Co₃O₄-nb@CG: Co₃O₄ ananobeads–CNTs (carbon nanotubes)–GNSs (graphene nanosheets). r) NiFe₂O₄–CT: NiFe₂O₄ nanocone forest on carbon textile; s) NiCo₂O₄/NGN/CNTs: NiCo₂O₄ nanosheets on nitrogen-doped graphene/carbon nanotubes; t) ZnO NR@NiO/MOO₂ CNSAs: ZnO nanorod@NiO/MoO₂ composite nanosheet arrays; u) Co₃O₄@Ni–Co–O NSRAs: Co₃O₄@Ni–Co–O nanosheet@nanorod arrays; v) Co₃O₄@NiO NWRAs: Co₃O₄@NiO nanowire@nanorod arrays.

Cathada matariala	Anada matariala	Moulting maltage	Device performance ^a		Def
Cathode materials	Anode materials	working voltage	Energy density	Power density	Kei.
δ -MnO ₂ microspheres	Activated carbon	0–2 V	48.06 W h kg ⁻¹	1.0 kW kg^{-1}	[80]
Enoki mushroom-like Co ₃ O ₄	Carbon	0–1.5 V	23.9 W h kg ⁻¹	0.375 kW kg^{-1}	[92]
CoO@MnO ₂ core-shell	Nitrogen-doped graphene	0–1.8 V	85.9 W h kg^{-1}	852.4 W kg ⁻¹	[136]
NiCo ₂ O ₄ @MnO ₂ nanosheets	Activated carbon	0–1.5 V	37.5 W h kg^{-1}	187.5 W kg^{-1}	[141]
MnO ₂ /RGO/CF ^b	GH/CW ^c	0–1.6 V	$0.63 \text{ mW h cm}^{-3}$	0.2 W cm ⁻³	[170]
NiCo ₂ O ₄ /NGN/CNTs ^d	NGN/CNTs ^e	0–1.55 V	42.7 W h kg ⁻¹	775 W kg^{-1}	[175]
Co ₃ O ₄ @CoMoO ₄ core-shell	CNTs ^f	0–1.6 V	45.2 W h kg ⁻¹	400 W kg^{-1}	[179]

 Table 2
 Typical hierarchically nanostructured TMOs as cathodes of asymmetric SCs

a) Device performance: the energy density of the asymmetric SCs device under a certain power density. b) $MnO_2/RGO/CF: MnO_2/reduced$ graphene oxide/carbon nanofiber; c) GH/CW: graphene hydrogel-wrapped Cu wire; d) $NiCo_2O_4/NGN/CNTs: NiCo_2O_4$ nanosheets on nitrogen-doped graphene/carbon nanotubes; e) NGN/CNTs: nitrogen-doped graphene/carbon nanotubes; f) CNTs: carbon nanotubes.

multi-component composites can maximize the benefits from all components, thereby making this approach a highly effective method to improve the performance of the TMO materials. Despite several reports on the composites of metal oxides with carbon nanomaterials, these materials still present massive development space in the future.

(2) Compared with general nanostructured TMOs, hierarchically nanostructured TMOs exhibits higher specific capacitance and better rate performance. However, although the hierarchical nanostructure is favorable for the electrochemical reaction of TMO electrode materials, this special structure often leads to the low tap density of the materials. Therefore, new reasonable structures should be designed for hierarchically nanostructured TMOs to endure large volume energy densities.

(3) It is obvious that the specific capacitances of most of the cobalt-based materials and nickel-based materials are much larger than those of other materials. Therefore, these materials are promising for practical applications. The future research of TMOs-based electrode materials can be focused on cobalt-based materials and nickelbased materials.

(4) The asymmetric SCs are a hot spot in the SC field at present. For asymmetric SCs, various negative and positive electrode materials with well-separated potential windows can be combined to maximize the output voltage; thus, the specific energy of SCs will be markedly increased.

(5) The self-supporting flexible electrode in SCs is another important research direction. When self-supporting flexible materials are used as electrodes, the conductive carbon and bonding agent are unnecessary for the assembly of SC device; thus, the energy density of device can be effectively improved. In addition, the self-supporting flexible electrode can enhance the circulation stability of device. Furthermore, the flexible all-solid-state asymmetric SCs device is crucial because of several advantageous properties, such as a wide operating voltage range, high energy densities, excellent flexibility, and superior long term cycling stability.

(6) Aqueous rechargeable batteries, such as Ni–Zn battery, Ni–MH battery, and Ni–Fe battery, have attracted renewed interest because of their high theoretical energy density, long cycling life, low cost, and safety [186]. Hierarchically nanostructured TMOs reviewed in this paper also can be applied in aqueous batteries [186]. This is also a very important research direction.

Received 7 July 2017; accepted 10 August 2017; published online 17 October 2017

- Simon P, Gogotsi Y. Materials for electrochemical capacitors. Nat Mater, 2008, 7: 845–854
- 2 Wang X, Lu X, Liu B, et al. Flexible energy-storage devices: design consideration and recent progress. Adv Mater, 2014, 26: 4763– 4782
- 3 Xie K, Wei B. Materials and structures for stretchable energy storage and conversion devices. Adv Mater, 2014, 26: 3592-3617
- 4 Yu D, Goh K, Wang H, *et al.* Scalable synthesis of hierarchically structured carbon nanotube–graphene fibres for capacitive energy storage. Nat Nanotech, 2014, 9: 555–562
- 5 Cheng XB, Huang JQ, Zhang Q, *et al.* Aligned carbon nanotube/ sulfur composite cathodes with high sulfur content for lithiumsulfur batteries. Nano Energ, 2014, 4: 65–72
- 6 Kim MS, Lim E, Kim S, *et al.* General synthesis of N-doped macroporous graphene-encapsulated mesoporous metal oxides and their application as new anode materials for sodium-ion hybrid supercapacitors. Adv Funct Mater, 2017, 27: 1603921
- 7 Zhang J, Zhao XS. On the configuration of supercapacitors for maximizing electrochemical performance. ChemSusChem, 2012, 5: 818-841
- 8 Simon P, Gogotsi Y, Dunn B. Where do batteries end and supercapacitors begin? Science, 2014, 343: 1210–1211
- 9 Lu Z, Wu X, Jiang M, et al. Transition metal oxides/hydroxides nanoarrays for aqueous electrochemical energy storage systems. Sci China Mater, 2014, 57: 59–69

- Feng N, He P, Zhou H. Enabling catalytic oxidation of Li₂O₂at the liquid-solid interface: the evolution of an aprotic Li-O₂ battery. ChemSusChem, 2015, 8: 600–602
- 11 Peng S, Li L, Hu Y, et al. Fabrication of spinel one-dimensional architectures by single-spinneret electrospinning for energy storage applications. ACS Nano, 2015, 9: 1945–1954
- 12 Jiang J, He P, Tong S, *et al.* Ruthenium functionalized graphene aerogels with hierarchical and three-dimensional porosity as a free-standing cathode for rechargeable lithium-oxygen batteries. NPG Asia Mater, 2016, 8: e239
- 13 Tong S, Zheng M, Lu Y, *et al.* Mesoporous NiO with a singlecrystalline structure utilized as a noble metal-free catalyst for non-aqueous Li–O₂ batteries. J Mater Chem A, 2015, 3: 16177– 16182
- 14 Yang S, He P, Zhou H. Exploring the electrochemical reaction mechanism of carbonate oxidation in Li–air/CO₂ battery through tracing missing oxygen. Energ Environ Sci, 2016, 9: 1650–1654
- 15 Zhang S, Zheng M, Lin Z, *et al.* Activated carbon with ultrahigh specific surface area synthesized from natural plant material for lithium-sulfur batteries. J Mater Chem A, 2014, 2: 15889–15896
- 16 Li N, Zheng M, Lu H, *et al.* High-rate lithium-sulfur batteries promoted by reduced graphene oxide coating. Chem Commun, 2012, 48: 4106–4108
- 17 Zhong Y, Xia X, Shi F, *et al.* Transition metal carbides and nitrides in energy storage and conversion. Adv Sci, 2016, 3: 1500286
- 18 Xie D, Xia X, Zhong Y, et al. Exploring advanced sandwiched arrays by vertical graphene and N-doped carbon for enhanced sodium storage. Adv Energ Mater, 2017, 7: 1601804
- 19 Wang Y, Song Y, Xia Y. Electrochemical capacitors: mechanism, materials, systems, characterization and applications. Chem Soc Rev, 2016, 45: 5925–5950
- 20 Wang G, Zhang L, Zhang J. A review of electrode materials for electrochemical supercapacitors. Chem Soc Rev, 2012, 41: 797– 828
- 21 Liu L, Niu Z, Chen J. Unconventional supercapacitors from nanocarbon-based electrode materials to device configurations. Chem Soc Rev, 2016, 45: 4340–4363
- 22 Chen S, Xing W, Duan J, *et al.* Nanostructured morphology control for efficient supercapacitor electrodes. J Mater Chem A, 2013, 1: 2941–2954
- 23 Cao X, Yin Z, Zhang H. Three-dimensional graphene materials: preparation, structures and application in supercapacitors. Energ Environ Sci, 2014, 7: 1850–1865
- 24 Qu C, Jiao Y, Zhao B, *et al.* Nickel-based pillared MOFs for highperformance supercapacitors: design, synthesis and stability study. Nano Energ, 2016, 26: 66–73
- 25 Dong Y, Xu X, Li S, *et al.* Inhibiting effect of Na⁺ pre-intercalation in MoO₃ nanobelts with enhanced electrochemical performance. Nano Energ, 2015, 15: 145–152
- 26 Zhang LL, Zhao XS. Carbon-based materials as supercapacitor electrodes. Chem Soc Rev, 2009, 38: 2520–2531
- 27 Naoi K, Naoi W, Aoyagi S, *et al.* New generation "nanohybrid supercapacitor". Acc Chem Res, 2013, 46: 1075–1083
- 28 Lu X, Yu M, Wang G, et al. Flexible solid-state supercapacitors: design, fabrication and applications. Energ Environ Sci, 2014, 7: 2160–2181
- 29 Li B, Zheng M, Xue H, *et al.* High performance electrochemical capacitor materials focusing on nickel based materials. Inorg Chem Front, 2016, 3: 175–202
- 30 Zhang F, Liu T, Hou G, et al. Hierarchically porous carbon foams

for electric double layer capacitors. Nano Res, 2016, 9: 2875-2888

- 31 Tan Q, Wang P, Liu H, *et al.* Hollow MO_x-RuO₂ (M = Co, Cu, Fe, Ni, CuNi) nanostructures as highly efficient electrodes for supercapacitors. Sci China Mater, 2016, 59: 323–336
- 32 Nie Z, Wang Y, Zhang Y, *et al.* Multi-shelled α-Fe₂O₃ microspheres for high-rate supercapacitors. Sci China Mater, 2016, 59: 247–253
- 33 Kumar R, Singh RK, Kumar Dubey P, *et al.* Hydrothermal synthesis of a uniformly dispersed hybrid graphene– TiO_2 nanostructure for optical and enhanced electrochemical applications. RSC Adv, 2015, 5: 7112–7120
- 34 Kumar R, Singh RK, Vaz AR, et al. Microwave-assisted synthesis and deposition of a thin ZnO layer on microwave-exfoliated graphene: optical and electrochemical evaluations. RSC Adv, 2015, 5: 67988–67995
- 35 Li Z, Ahadi K, Jiang K, *et al.* Freestanding hierarchical porous carbon film derived from hybrid nanocellulose for high-power supercapacitors. Nano Res, 2017, 10: 1847–1860
- 36 Shi JL, Du WC, Yin YX, et al. Hydrothermal reduction of threedimensional graphene oxide for binder-free flexible supercapacitors. J Mater Chem A, 2014, 2: 10830–10834
- 37 Zhai T, Wan L, Sun S, *et al.* Phosphate ion functionalized Co₃O₄ ultrathin nanosheets with greatly improved surface reactivity for high performance pseudocapacitors. Adv Mater, 2017, 29: 1604167
- 38 Yi J, Qing Y, Wu CT, et al. Lignocellulose-derived porous phosphorus-doped carbon as advanced electrode for supercapacitors. J Power Sources, 2017, 351: 130–137
- 39 Yu M, Lin D, Feng H, *et al.* Boosting the energy density of carbon-based aqueous supercapacitors by optimizing the surface charge. Angew Chem Int Ed, 2017, 56: 5454–5459
- 40 Li Y, Tang F, Wang R, *et al.* Novel dual-ion hybrid supercapacitor based on a NiCo₂O₄ nanowire cathode and MoO₂-C nanofilm anode. ACS Appl Mater Interfaces, 2016, 8: 30232–30238
- 41 Lu X, Zhai T, Zhang X, et al. WO_{3-x}@Au@MnO₂ core-shell nanowires on carbon fabric for high-performance flexible supercapacitors. Adv Mater, 2012, 24: 938–944
- 42 Yan Y, Gu P, Zheng S, *et al.* Facile synthesis of an accordion-like Ni-MOF superstructure for high-performance flexible supercapacitors. J Mater Chem A, 2016, 4: 19078–19085
- 43 Amali AJ, Sun JK, Xu Q. From assembled metal-organic framework nanoparticles to hierarchically porous carbon for electrochemical energy storage. Chem Commun, 2014, 50: 1519–1522
- 44 Liang Q, Ye L, Huang ZH, *et al.* A honeycomb-like porous carbon derived from pomelo peel for use in high-performance supercapacitors. Nanoscale, 2014, 6: 13831–13837
- 45 Sun G, Zhang X, Lin R, *et al.* Weavable, high-performance, solidstate supercapacitors based on hybrid fibers made of sandwiched structure of MWCNT/rGO/MWCNT. Adv Electron Mater, 2016, 2: 1600102
- 46 Owusu KA, Qu L, Li J, *et al.* Low-crystalline iron oxide hydroxide nanoparticle anode for high-performance supercapacitors. Nat Commun, 2017, 8: 14264
- Wu ZS, Wang DW, Ren W, *et al.* Anchoring hydrous RuO₂ on graphene sheets for high-performance electrochemical capacitors. Adv Funct Mater, 2010, 20: 3595–3602
- 48 Jiang J, Li Y, Liu J, *et al.* Recent advances in metal oxide-based electrode architecture design for electrochemical energy storage. Adv Mater, 2012, 24: 5166–5180
- 49 Cao CY, Guo W, Cui ZM, et al. Microwave-assisted gas/liquid

interfacial synthesis of flowerlike NiO hollow nanosphere precursors and their application as supercapacitor electrodes. J Mater Chem, 2011, 21: 3204–3209

- 50 Endut Z, Hamdi M, Basirun WJ. Pseudocapacitive performance of vertical copper oxide nanoflakes. Thin Solid Films, 2013, 528: 213–216
- 51 Zhong JH, Wang AL, Li GR, *et al.* Co₃O₄/Ni(OH)₂ composite mesoporous nanosheet networks as a promising electrode for supercapacitor applications. J Mater Chem, 2012, 22: 5656–5665
- 52 Li R, Ren X, Zhang F, *et al.* Synthesis of Fe₃O₄@SnO₂ core-shell nanorod film and its application as a thin-film supercapacitor electrode. Chem Commun, 2012, 48: 5010–5012
- 53 Li F, Xing Y, Huang M, et al. MnO₂ nanostructures with threedimensional (3D) morphology replicated from diatoms for highperformance supercapacitors. J Mater Chem A, 2015, 3: 7855– 7861
- 54 Vijayakumar S, Nagamuthu S, Muralidharan G. Supercapacitor studies on NiO nanoflakes synthesized through a microwave route. ACS Appl Mater Interfaces, 2013, 5: 2188–2196
- 55 Wang C, Zhang X, Zhang D, *et al.* Facile and low-cost fabrication of nanostructured NiCo₂O₄ spinel with high specific capacitance and excellent cycle stability. Electrochim Acta, 2012, 63: 220–227
- 56 Wang C, Zhang X, Li C, et al. Facile fabrication of nanostructured NiCo₂O₄ supported on Ni foam for high performance electrochemical energy storage. RSC Adv, 2015, 5: 80620–80624
- 57 Liu X, Liu J, Sun X. NiCo₂O₄@NiO hybrid arrays with improved electrochemical performance for pseudocapacitors. J Mater Chem A, 2015, 3: 13900–13905
- 58 Park S, Nam I, Kim GP, et al. Hybrid MnO₂ film with agarose gel for enhancing the structural integrity of thin film supercapacitor electrodes. ACS Appl Mater Interfaces, 2013, 5: 9908–9912
- 59 Yang P, Ding Y, Lin Z, et al. Low-cost high-performance solidstate asymmetric supercapacitors based on MnO₂ nanowires and Fe₂O₃ nanotubes. Nano Lett, 2014, 14: 731–736
- 60 Kai K, Kobayashi Y, Yamada Y, *et al.* Electrochemical characterization of single-layer MnO₂ nanosheets as a high-capacitance pseudocapacitor electrode. J Mater Chem, 2012, 22: 14691– 14695
- 61 Chen LH, Li XY, Rooke JC, *et al.* Hierarchically structured zeolites: synthesis, mass transport properties and applications. J Mater Chem, 2012, 22: 17381–17403
- 62 Trogadas P, Ramani V, Strasser P, *et al.* Hierarchically structured nanomaterials for electrochemical energy conversion. Angew Chem Int Ed, 2016, 55: 122–148
- 63 Choi BG, Huh YS, Hong WH, *et al.* Electroactive nanoparticle directed assembly of functionalized graphene nanosheets into hierarchical structures with hybrid compositions for flexible supercapacitors. Nanoscale, 2013, 5: 3976–3981
- 64 Duay J, Sherrill SA, Gui Z, et al. Self-limiting electrodeposition of hierarchical MnO₂ and M(OH)₂/MnO₂ nanofibril/nanowires: mechanism and supercapacitor properties. ACS Nano, 2013, 7: 1200–1214
- 65 Li Y, Fu ZY, Su BL. Hierarchically structured porous materials for energy conversion and storage. Adv Funct Mater, 2012, 22: 4634– 4667
- 66 Yue Y, Liang H. Hierarchical micro-architectures of electrodes for energy storage. J Power Sources, 2015, 284: 435–445
- 67 Li S, Dong YF, Wang DD, *et al*. Hierarchical nanowires for highperformance electrochemical energy storage. Front Phys, 2014, 9: 303–322

- 68 Ma Z, Shao G, Fan Y, *et al.* Construction of hierarchical α-MnO₂ nanowires@ultrathin δ-MnO₂ nanosheets core-shell nanostructure with excellent cycling stability for high-power asymmetric supercapacitor electrodes. ACS Appl Mater Interfaces, 2016, 8: 9050–9058
- 69 Zhang X, Miao W, Li C, et al. Microwave-assisted rapid synthesis of birnessite-type MnO₂ nanoparticles for high performance supercapacitor applications. Mater Res Bull, 2015, 71: 111–115
- 70 Zhang X, Sun X, Zhang H, *et al.* Comparative performance of birnessite-type MnO₂ nanoplates and octahedral molecular sieve (OMS-5) nanobelts of manganese dioxide as electrode materials for supercapacitor application. Electrochim Acta, 2014, 132: 315– 322
- 71 Zhang X, Sun X, Zhang H, *et al.* Microwave-assisted reflux rapid synthesis of MnO₂ nanostructures and their application in supercapacitors. ElectroChim Acta, 2013, 87: 637–644
- 72 Zhang X, Yu P, Zhang H, *et al.* Rapid hydrothermal synthesis of hierarchical nanostructures assembled from ultrathin birnessitetype MnO₂ nanosheets for supercapacitor applications. Electrochim Acta, 2013, 89: 523–529
- 73 Yu P, Zhang X, Chen Y, et al. Solution-combustion synthesis of ε-MnO₂ for supercapacitors. Mater Lett, 2010, 64: 61–64
- 74 Yu P, Zhang X, Wang D, et al. Shape-controlled synthesis of 3D hierarchical MnO₂ nanostructures for electrochemical supercapacitors. Cryst Growth Des, 2009, 9: 528–533
- 75 Yu P, Zhang X, Chen Y, *et al.* Preparation and pseudo-capacitance of birnessite-type MnO₂ nanostructures *via* microwave-assisted emulsion method. Mater Chem Phys, 2009, 118: 303–307
- 76 Yuan C, Hou L, Yang L, *et al.* Facile interfacial synthesis of flower-like hierarchical a-MnO₂ sub-microspherical superstructures constructed by two-dimension mesoporous nanosheets and their application in electrochemical capacitors. J Mater Chem, 2011, 21: 16035–16041
- 77 Sumboja A, Tefashe UM, Wittstock G, et al. Monitoring electroactive ions at manganese dioxide pseudocapacitive electrodes with scanning electrochemical microscope for supercapacitor electrodes. J Power Sources, 2012, 207: 205–211
- 78 Yu LL, Zhu JJ, Zhao JT. Beta-manganese dioxide nanoflowers self-assembled by ultrathin nanoplates with enhanced supercapacitive performance. J Mater Chem A, 2014, 2: 9353–9360
- 79 Jiang H, Sun T, Li C, *et al.* Hierarchical porous nanostructures assembled from ultrathin MnO₂ nanoflakes with enhanced supercapacitive performances. J Mater Chem, 2012, 22: 2751–2756
- 80 Bag S, Raj CR. Facile shape-controlled growth of hierarchical mesoporous $\delta\text{-MnO}_2$ for the development of asymmetric super-capacitors. J Mater Chem A, 2016, 4: 8384–8394
- 81 Liu B, Zhang X, Shioyama H, *et al.* Converting cobalt oxide subunits in cobalt metal-organic framework into agglomerated Co_3O_4 nanoparticles as an electrode material for lithium ion battery. J Power Sources, 2010, 195: 857–861
- 82 Yuan C, Yang L, Hou L, *et al.* Growth of ultrathin mesoporous Co₃O₄ nanosheet arrays on Ni foam for high-performance electrochemical capacitors. Energ Environ Sci, 2012, 5: 7883–7887
- 83 Zheng M, Cao J, Liao S, et al. Preparation of mesoporous Co₃O₄ nanoparticles via solid–liquid route and effects of calcination temperature and textural parameters on their electrochemical capacitive behaviors. J Phys Chem C, 2009, 113: 3887–3894
- 84 Yang Q, Lu Z, Chang Z, et al. Hierarchical Co₃O₄ nanosheet@nanowire arrays with enhanced pseudocapacitive performance. RSC Adv, 2012, 2: 1663–1668

REVIEWS

- 85 Yuan C, Yang L, Hou L, *et al.* Large-scale Co₃O₄ nanoparticles growing on nickel sheets *via* a one-step strategy and their ultrahighly reversible redox reaction toward supercapacitors. J Mater Chem, 2011, 21: 18183–18185
- 86 Xia X, Tu J, Mai Y, *et al.* Self-supported hydrothermal synthesized hollow Co₃O₄ nanowire arrays with high supercapacitor capacitance. J Mater Chem, 2011, 21: 9319–9325
- 87 Zheng Y, Li Z, Xu J, et al. Multi-channeled hierarchical porous carbon incorporated Co₃O₄ nanopillar arrays as 3D binder-free electrode for high performance supercapacitors. Nano Energ, 2016, 20: 94–107
- 88 Yadav AA, Chavan UJ. Electrochemical supercapacitive performance of spray deposited Co_3O_4 thin film nanostructures. Electrochim Acta, 2017, 232: 370–376
- 89 Xiong S, Yuan C, Zhang X, *et al.* Controllable synthesis of mesoporous Co₃O₄ nanostructures with tunable morphology for application in supercapacitors. Chem Eur J, 2009, 15: 5320–5326
- 90 Zhu T, Chen JS, Lou XW. Shape-controlled synthesis of porous Co_3O_4 nanostructures for application in supercapacitors. J Mater Chem, 2010, 20: 7015–7020
- 91 Duan BR, Cao Q. Hierarchically porous Co₃O₄ film prepared by hydrothermal synthesis method based on colloidal crystal template for supercapacitor application. Electrochim Acta, 2012, 64: 154–161
- 92 Luo F, Li J, Lei Y, *et al.* Three-dimensional enoki mushroom-like Co_3O_4 hierarchitectures constructed by one-dimension nanowires for high-performance supercapacitors. Electrochim Acta, 2014, 135: 495–502
- 93 Zhou X, Shen X, Xia Z, et al. Hollow fluffy Co₃O₄ cages as efficient electroactive materials for supercapacitors and oxygen evolution reaction. ACS Appl Mater Interfaces, 2015, 7: 20322–20331
- 94 Qian Y, Liu R, Wang Q, *et al.* Efficient synthesis of hierarchical NiO nanosheets for high-performance flexible all-solid-state supercapacitors. J Mater Chem A, 2014, 2: 10917–10922
- 95 Meher SK, Justin P, Ranga Rao G. Microwave-mediated synthesis for improved morphology and pseudocapacitance performance of nickel oxide. ACS Appl Mater Interfaces, 2011, 3: 2063–2073
- 96 Huang ML, Gu CD, Ge X, et al. NiO nanoflakes grown on porous graphene frameworks as advanced electrochemical pseudocapacitor materials. J Power Sources, 2014, 259: 98–105
- 97 Li J, Zhao W, Huang F, *et al.* Single-crystalline Ni(OH)₂ and NiO nanoplatelet arrays as supercapacitor electrodes. Nanoscale, 2011, 3: 5103–5109
- 98 Liu T, Jiang C, Cheng B, *et al.* Hierarchical flower-like C/NiO composite hollow microspheres and its excellent supercapacitor performance. J Power Sources, 2017, 359: 371–378
- 99 Lu Z, Chang Z, Liu J, et al. Stable ultrahigh specific capacitance of NiO nanorod arrays. Nano Res, 2011, 4: 658–665
- 100 An L, Xu K, Li W, *et al.* Exceptional pseudocapacitive properties of hierarchical NiO ultrafine nanowires grown on mesoporous NiO nanosheets. J Mater Chem A, 2014, 2: 12799–12804
- 101 Cao F, Pan GX, Xia XH, et al. Synthesis of hierarchical porous NiO nanotube arrays for supercapacitor application. J Power Sources, 2014, 264: 161–167
- 102 Yang Z, Xu F, Zhang W, et al. Controllable preparation of multishelled NiO hollow nanospheres via layer-by-layer self-assembly for supercapacitor application. J Power Sources, 2014, 246: 24–31
- 103 Meng G, Yang Q, Wu X, et al. Hierarchical mesoporous NiO nanoarrays with ultrahigh capacitance for aqueous hybrid su-

percapacitor. Nano Energ, 2016, 30: 831-839

- 104 Yang Y, Pei L, Xu X, et al. In-situ growth of self-assembled 3D Cu₂O@Cu foam with enhanced electrochemical properties. Electrochim Acta, 2016, 221: 56–61
- 105 Dong C, Wang Y, Xu J, et al. 3D binder-free Cu₂ O@Cu nanoneedle arrays for high-performance asymmetric supercapacitors. J Mater Chem A, 2014, 2: 18229–18235
- 106 Deng MJ, Wang CC, Ho PJ, et al. Facile electrochemical synthesis of 3D nano-architectured CuO electrodes for high-performance supercapacitors. J Mater Chem A, 2014, 2: 12857–12865
- 107 He D, Xing S, Sun B, et al. Design and construction of threedimensional flower-like CuO hierarchical nanostructures on copper foam for high performance supercapacitor. Electrochim Acta, 2016, 210: 639–645
- 108 Lu Y, Yan H, Qiu K, et al. Hierarchical porous CuO nanostructures with tunable properties for high performance supercapacitors. RSC Adv, 2015, 5: 10773–10781
- 109 Li L, Zhang X, Zhang Z, et al. A bismuth oxide nanosheet-coated electrospun carbon nanofiber film: a free-standing negative electrode for flexible asymmetric supercapacitors. J Mater Chem A, 2016, 4: 16635–16644
- 110 Fan HT, Teng XM, Pan SS, *et al.* Optical properties of δ -Bi₂O₃ thin films grown by reactive sputtering. Appl Phys Lett, 2005, 87: 231916
- 111 He W, Qin W, Wu X, *et al.* The photocatalytic properties of bismuth oxide films prepared through the sol-gel method. Thin Solid Films, 2007, 515: 5362–5365
- Gujar TP, Shinde VR, Lokhande CD, *et al.* Electrosynthesis of Bi₂O₃ thin films and their use in electrochemical supercapacitors. J Power Sources, 2006, 161: 1479–1485
- 113 Zheng FL, Li GR, Ou YN, *et al.* Synthesis of hierarchical rippled Bi₂O₃ nanobelts for supercapacitor applications. Chem Commun, 2010, 46: 5021–5023
- 114 Su H, Cao S, Xia N, *et al.* Controllable growth of Bi₂O₃ with rodlike structures *via* the surfactants and its electrochemical properties. J Appl Electrochem, 2014, 44: 735–740
- 115 Zhou J, Huang Y, Cao X, *et al.* Two-dimensional NiCo₂O₄ nanosheet-coated three-dimensional graphene networks for highrate, long-cycle-life supercapacitors. Nanoscale, 2015, 7: 7035– 7039
- 116 Ma FX, Yu L, Xu CY, *et al.* Self-supported formation of hierarchical $NiCo_2O_4$ tetragonal microtubes with enhanced electrochemical properties. Energ Environ Sci, 2016, 9: 862–866
- 117 Gao G, Wu HB, Ding S, et al. Hierarchical NiCo₂O₄ nanosheets grown on Ni nanofoam as high-performance electrodes for supercapacitors. Small, 2015, 11: 804–808
- 118 Yuan C, Li J, Hou L, *et al.* Ultrathin mesoporous $NiCo_2O_4$ nanosheets supported on ni foam as advanced electrodes for supercapacitors. Adv Funct Mater, 2012, 22: 4592–4597
- 119 Wei TY, Chen CH, Chien HC, et al. A cost-effective supercapacitor material of ultrahigh specific capacitances: spinel nickel cobaltite aerogels from an epoxide-driven sol-gel process. Adv Mater, 2010, 22: 347–351
- 120 Zou R, Xu K, Wang T, *et al.* Chain-like NiCo₂O₄ nanowires with different exposed reactive planes for high-performance supercapacitors. J Mater Chem A, 2013, 1: 8560–8566
- 121 Jiang H, Ma J, Li C. Hierarchical porous NiCo₂O₄ nanowires for high-rate supercapacitors. Chem Commun, 2012, 48: 4465–4467
- 122 Wang Q, Liu B, Wang X, et al. Morphology evolution of urchinlike NiCo₂O₄ nanostructures and their applications as psuedo-

capacitors and photoelectrochemical cells. J Mater Chem, 2012, 22: 21647-21653

- 123 Guo J, Yin Z, Zang X, *et al.* Facile one-pot synthesis of NiCo₂O₄ hollow spheres with controllable number of shells for high-per-formance supercapacitors. Nano Res, 2017, 10: 405–414
- 124 Lei Y, Li J, Wang Y, *et al.* Rapid microwave-assisted green synthesis of 3D hierarchical flower-shaped NiCo₂O₄ microsphere for high-performance supercapacitor. ACS Appl Mater Interfaces, 2014, 6: 1773–1780
- 125 Zhou Q, Xing J, Gao Y, et al. Ordered assembly of NiCo₂O₄ multiple hierarchical structures for high-performance pseudocapacitors. ACS Appl Mater Interfaces, 2014, 6: 11394–11402
- 126 Xu X, Zhou H, Ding S, et al. The facile synthesis of hierarchical NiCoO2 nanotubes comprised ultrathin nanosheets for supercapacitors. J Power Sources, 2014, 267: 641–647
- 127 Butt FK, Tahir M, Cao C, et al. Synthesis of novel ZnV₂O₄ hierarchical nanospheres and their applications as electrochemical supercapacitor and hydrogen storage material. ACS Appl Mater Interfaces, 2014, 6: 13635–13641
- 128 Liu J, Zheng M, Shi X, et al. Amorphous FeOOH quantum dots assembled mesoporous film anchored on graphene nanosheets with superior electrochemical performance for supercapacitors. Adv Funct Mater, 2016, 26: 919–930
- 129 Liu L, Guo H, Liu J, et al. Self-assembled hierarchical yolk-shell structured NiO@C from metal-organic frameworks with outstanding performance for lithium storage. Chem Commun, 2014, 50: 9485–9488
- 130 Yu L, Zhang G, Yuan C, et al. Hierarchical NiCo₂O₄@MnO₂ coreshell heterostructured nanowire arrays on Ni foam as high-performance supercapacitor electrodes. Chem Commun, 2013, 49: 137–139
- Shin DH, Lee JS, Jun J, *et al.* Fabrication of amorphous carboncoated NiO nanofibers for electrochemical capacitor applications. J Mater Chem A, 2014, 2: 3364–3371
- 132 Xia H, Hong C, Li B, et al. Facile synthesis of hematite quantumdot/functionalized graphene-sheet composites as advanced anode materials for asymmetric supercapacitors. Adv Funct Mater, 2015, 25: 627–635
- 133 Wang K, Yang J, Zhu J, et al. General solution-processed formation of porous transition-metal oxides on exfoliated molybdenum disulfides for high-performance asymmetric supercapacitors. J Mater Chem A, 2017, 5: 11236–11245
- 134 Zhang Y, Zheng M, Qu M, et al. Core-shell Co₁₁(HPO₃)₈(OH)₆-Co₃O₄ hybrids for high-performance flexible all-solid-state asymmetric supercapacitors. J Alloys Compd, 2015, 651: 214–221
- 135 Zhou M, Lu F, Shen X, *et al.* One-pot construction of three dimensional CoMoO₄/Co₃O₄ hybrid nanostructures and their application in supercapacitors. J Mater Chem A, 2015, 3: 21201– 21210
- 136 Li C, Balamurugan J, Thanh TD, et al. 3D hierarchical CoO@MnO₂ core-shell nanohybrid for high-energy solid state asymmetric supercapacitors. J Mater Chem A, 2017, 5: 397–408
- 137 Zhu J, Tang S, Xie H, *et al.* Hierarchically porous MnO_2 microspheres doped with homogeneously distributed Fe₃O₄ nanoparticles for supercapacitors. ACS Appl Mater Interfaces, 2014, 6: 17637–17646
- 138 Kong D, Luo J, Wang Y, et al. Three-dimensional Co₃O₄@MnO₂ hierarchical nanoneedle arrays: morphology control and electrochemical energy storage. Adv Funct Mater, 2014, 24: 3815– 3826

- 139 Ge H, Wang C, Yin L. Hierarchical Cu_{0.27}Co_{2.73}O₄/MnO₂ nanorod arrays grown on 3D nickel foam as promising electrode materials for electrochemical capacitors. J Mater Chem A, 2015, 3: 17359– 17368
- 140 Bao F, Zhang Z, Guo W, et al. Facile synthesis of three dimensional NiCo₂O₄@MnO₂ core-shell nanosheet arrays and its supercapacitive performance. Electrochim Acta, 2015, 157: 31-40
- 141 Zhang Y, Wang B, Liu F, *et al.* Full synergistic contribution of electrodeposited three-dimensional $NiCo_2O_4@MnO_2$ nanosheet networks electrode for asymmetric supercapacitors. Nano Energ, 2016, 27: 627–637
- 142 Zhu J, Xu Z, Lu B. Ultrafine Au nanoparticles decorated $NiCo_2O_4$ nanotubes as anode material for high-performance supercapacitor and lithium-ion battery applications. Nano Energ, 2014, 7: 114–123
- 143 Han N, Cao S, Han J, et al. Surface cavities of Ni(OH)₂ nanowires can host Au nanoparticles as supported catalysts with high catalytic activity and stability. J Mater Chem A, 2016, 4: 2590–2596
- Hu H, Pei Z, Fan H, et al. 3D interdigital Au/MnO₂/Au stacked hybrid electrodes for on-chip microsupercapacitors. Small, 2016, 12: 3059–3069
- 145 Qu B, Hu L, Chen Y, *et al.* Rational design of Au-NiO hierarchical structures with enhanced rate performance for supercapacitors. J Mater Chem A, 2013, 1: 7023-7026
- Liu S, Guo S, Sun S, *et al.* Dumbbell-like Au-Fe₃O₄ nanoparticles:
 a new nanostructure for supercapacitors. Nanoscale, 2015, 7: 4890–4893
- 147 Li W, Li G, Sun J, et al. Hierarchical heterostructures of MnO₂ nanosheets or nanorods grown on Au-coated Co₃O₄ porous nanowalls for high-performance pseudocapacitance. Nanoscale, 2013, 5: 2901–2908
- 148 Li Q, Wang ZL, Li GR, et al. Design and synthesis of MnO₂/Mn/ MnO₂ sandwich-structured nanotube arrays with high supercapacitive performance for electrochemical energy storage. Nano Lett, 2012, 12: 3803–3807
- 149 Bao L, Zang J, Li X. Flexible Zn₂SnO₄/MnO₂ core/shell nanocable –carbon microfiber hybrid composites for high-performance supercapacitor electrodes. Nano Lett, 2011, 11: 1215–1220
- 150 Xia X, Tu J, Zhang Y, *et al.* High-quality metal oxide core/shell nanowire arrays on conductive substrates for electrochemical energy storage. ACS Nano, 2012, 6: 5531–5538
- 151 Zheng X, Yan X, Sun Y, *et al.* Au-embedded ZnO/NiO hybrid with excellent electrochemical performance as advanced electrode materials for supercapacitor. ACS Appl Mater Interfaces, 2015, 7: 2480–2485
- 152 Xia X, Tu J, Zhang Y, *et al.* Porous hydroxide nanosheets on preformed nanowires by electrodeposition: branched nanoarrays for electrochemical energy storage. Chem Mater, 2012, 24: 3793– 3799
- 153 Fan W, Xia YY, Tjiu WW, *et al.* Nitrogen-doped graphene hollow nanospheres as novel electrode materials for supercapacitor applications. J Power Sources, 2013, 243: 973–981
- 154 Peng L, Peng X, Liu B, et al. Ultrathin two-dimensional MnO₂/ graphene hybrid nanostructures for high-performance, flexible planar supercapacitors. Nano Lett, 2013, 13: 2151–2157
- 155 Qu L, Zhao Y, Khan AM, *et al.* Interwoven three-dimensional architecture of cobalt oxide nanobrush-graphene@Ni_xCo_{2x}(OH)_{6x} for high-performance supercapacitors. Nano Lett, 2015, 15: 2037– 2044
- 156 Xia W, Mahmood A, Zou R, et al. Metal-organic frameworks and

their derived nanostructures for electrochemical energy storage and conversion. Energ Environ Sci, 2015, 8: 1837–1866

- 157 Zhu G, He Z, Chen J, et al. Highly conductive three-dimensional MnO₂-carbon nanotube-graphene-Ni hybrid foam as a binderfree supercapacitor electrode. Nanoscale, 2014, 6: 1079-1085
- 158 Xie J, Sun X, Zhang N, *et al.* Layer-by-layer β -Ni(OH)₂/graphene nanohybrids for ultraflexible all-solid-state thin-film supercapacitors with high electrochemical performance. Nano Energ, 2013, 2: 65–74
- 159 Zhang W, Quan B, Lee C, *et al.* One-step facile solvothermal synthesis of copper ferrite-graphene composite as a high-performance supercapacitor material. ACS Appl Mater Interfaces, 2015, 7: 2404–2414
- 160 Kumar R, Dubey PK, Singh RK, *et al.* Catalyst-free synthesis of a three-dimensional nanoworm-like gallium oxide–graphene nanosheet hybrid structure with enhanced optical properties. RSC Adv, 2016, 6: 17669–17677
- 161 Kumar R, Savu R, Joanni E, et al. Fabrication of interdigitated micro-supercapacitor devices by direct laser writing onto ultrathin, flexible and free-standing graphite oxide films. RSC Adv, 2016, 6: 84769–84776
- 162 Kumar R, Singh RK, Dubey PK, *et al.* Freestanding 3D graphenenickel encapsulated nitrogen-rich aligned bamboo like carbon nanotubes for high-performance supercapacitors with robust cycle stability. Adv Mater Interfaces, 2015, 2: 1500191
- 163 Singh RK, Kumar R, Singh DP. Graphene oxide: strategies for synthesis, reduction and frontier applications. RSC Adv, 2016, 6: 64993-65011
- 164 Kumar R, Kim HJ, Park S, et al. Graphene-wrapped and cobalt oxide-intercalated hybrid for extremely durable super-capacitor with ultrahigh energy and power densities. Carbon, 2014, 79: 192–202
- 165 Kumar R, Singh RK, Savu R, *et al.* Microwave-assisted synthesis of void-induced graphene-wrapped nickel oxide hybrids for supercapacitor applications. RSC Adv, 2016, 6: 26612–26620
- 166 Kumar R, Singh RK, Vaz AR, et al. Self-assembled and one-step synthesis of interconnected 3D network of Fe₃O₄/reduced graphene oxide nanosheets hybrid for high-performance supercapacitor electrode. ACS Appl Mater Interfaces, 2017, 9: 8880– 8890
- 167 Fan L, Tang L, Gong H, et al. Carbon-nanoparticles encapsulated in hollow nickel oxides for supercapacitor application. J Mater Chem, 2012, 22: 16376–16381
- 168 Huang SZ, Cai Y, Jin J, et al. Hierarchical mesoporous urchin-like Mn₃O₄/carbon microspheres with highly enhanced lithium battery performance by *in-situ* carbonization of new lamellar manganese alkoxide (Mn-DEG). Nano Energ, 2015, 12: 833–844
- 169 Zheng M, Qiu D, Zhao B, et al. Mesoporous iron oxide directly anchored on a graphene matrix for lithium-ion battery anodes with enhanced strain accommodation. RSC Adv, 2013, 3: 699– 703
- 170 Zhang Z, Xiao F, Wang S. Hierarchically structured MnO₂/graphene/carbon fiber and porous graphene hydrogel wrapped copper wire for fiber-based flexible all-solid-state asymmetric supercapacitors. J Mater Chem A, 2015, 3: 11215–11223
- 171 Ge J, Yao HB, Hu W, et al. Facile dip coating processed graphene/ MnO₂ nanostructured sponges as high performance supercapacitor electrodes. Nano Energ, 2013, 2: 505–513
- 172 Kumar R, Singh RK, Dubey PK, *et al.* Self-assembled hierarchical formation of conjugated 3D cobalt oxide nanobead–CNT–gra-

phene nanostructure using microwaves for high-performance supercapacitor electrode. ACS Appl Mater Interfaces, 2015, 7: 15042–15051

- 173 Zhang J, Zhao X, Huang Z, *et al.* High-performance all-solid-state flexible supercapacitors based on manganese dioxide/carbon fibers. Carbon, 2016, 107: 844–851
- 174 Javed MS, Zhang C, Chen L, *et al.* Hierarchical mesoporous $NiFe_2O_4$ nanocone forest directly growing on carbon textile for high performance flexible supercapacitors. J Mater Chem A, 2016, 4: 8851–8859
- 175 Yue S, Tong H, Lu L, *et al.* Hierarchical $NiCo_2O_4$ nanosheets/ nitrogen doped graphene/carbon nanotube film with ultrahigh capacitance and long cycle stability as a flexible binder-free electrode for supercapacitors. J Mater Chem A, 2017, 5: 689–698
- 176 Hou S, Zhang G, Zeng W, et al. Hierarchical core-shell structure of ZnO nanorod@NiO/MoO₂ composite nanosheet arrays for high-performance supercapacitors. ACS Appl Mater Interfaces, 2014, 6: 13564–13570
- 177 Mai LQ, Yang F, Zhao YL, *et al.* Hierarchical MnMoO₄/CoMoO₄ heterostructured nanowires with enhanced supercapacitor performance. Nat Commun, 2011, 2: 381
- 178 Ding Y, Wan Y, Min YL, *et al.* General synthesis and phase control of metal molybdate hydrates $MMoO_4$ · nH_2O (M = Co, Ni, Mn, n = 0, 3/4, 1) nano/microcrystals by a hydrothermal approach: magnetic, photocatalytic, and electrochemical properties. Inorg Chem, 2008, 47: 7813–7823
- 179 Wang J, Zhang X, Wei Q, et al. 3D self-supported nanopine forest-like Co₃O₄@CoMoO₄ core-shell architectures for highenergy solid state supercapacitors. Nano Energ, 2016, 19: 222–233
- 180 Lu Z, Yang Q, Zhu W, et al. Hierarchical Co₃O₄@Ni-Co-O supercapacitor electrodes with ultrahigh specific capacitance per area. Nano Res, 2012, 5: 369–378
- 181 Yang Q, Lu Z, Li T, *et al.* Hierarchical construction of core-shell metal oxide nanoarrays with ultrahigh areal capacitance. Nano Energ, 2014, 7: 170–178
- 182 Wu X, Lu Z, Zhu W, et al. High-performance aqueous battery with double hierarchical nanoarrays. Nano Energ, 2014, 10: 229– 234
- 183 Lin YG, Hsu YK, Lin YC, *et al.* Hierarchical Fe₂O₃ nanotube/ nickel foam electrodes for electrochemical energy storage. Electrochim Acta, 2016, 216: 287–294
- 184 Wu Q, Chen M, Chen K, et al. Fe₃O₄-based core/shell nanocomposites for high-performance electrochemical supercapacitors. J Mater Sci, 2016, 51: 1572–1580
- 185 Liu Z, Tian X, Xu X, *et al.* Capacitance and voltage matching between MnO₂ nanoflake cathode and Fe₂O₃ nanoparticle anode for high-performance asymmetric micro-supercapacitors. Nano Res, 2017, 10: 2471–2481
- 186 Lu Z, Wu X, Lei X, et al. Hierarchical nanoarray materials for advanced nickel-zinc batteries. Inorg Chem Front, 2015, 2: 184– 187

Acknowledgements This work was supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (51202106, 21671170 and 21673203) and New Century Excellent Talents of the University in China (NCET-13-0645), the Innovation Scientists and Technicians Troop Construction Projects of Henan Province (164200510018), the Plan for Scientific Innovation Talent of Henan Province, the Program for Innovative Research Team (in Science and Technology) in the University of Henan Province (14IRTSTHN004 and 16IRTSTHN003), the Science & Tech-

nology Foundation of Henan Province (122102210253 and 13A150019), the Science & Technology Foundation of Jiangsu Province (BK20150438), the Six Talent Plan (2015-XCL-030), and China Postdoctoral Science Foundation (2012M521115). We also acknowledge the Priority Academic Program Development of Jiangsu Higher Education Institutions and the technical support we received at the Testing Center of Yangzhou University. Author contributions Zheng M, Xiao X and Li L organized the literatures and wrote the manuscript. Gu P participated in writing and revising the manuscript. Dai X, Tang H, Hu Q, and Xue H revised the manuscript. Pang H provided the overall concept and revised the manuscript. All authors participated in the general discussion.

Conflict of interest The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.



Mingbo Zheng received his PhD in material processing engineering from Nanjing University of Aeronautics and Astronautics in 2009. He was a postdoctoral researcher at Nanjing University from 2009 to 2012. He was an associate researcher at Nanjing University from 2012 to 2015. He is currently an associate professor at Yanzhou University. His research interests are in the field of materials for electrochemical energy storge, including supercapacitor, lithium-ion battery, and lithium-sulfur battery.



Huan Pang received his PhD degree from Nanjing University in 2011. He then founded his research group in Anyang Normal University where he was appointed as a distinguished professor in 2013. He has now jointed Yangzhou University as a University Distinguished Professor. His research interests include the development of inorganic nanostructures and their applications in flexible electronics with a focus on energy devices.

多级纳米结构过渡金属氧化物作为超级电容器电极材料的应用

郑明波,肖潇,李露露,顾鹏,戴晓,唐浩,胡钦,薛怀国,庞欢*

摘要为了应对化石燃料短缺与日益严重的环境污染问题,开发高效、清洁、可持续的电化学储能技术已迫在眉睫.超级电容器,由于其功率密度高、充放电时间短、循环寿命长等特点,已得到广泛关注.多种过渡金属氧化物已被作为超级电容器电极材料进行了深入研究.为了进一步提高性能,具有多级纳米结构的过渡金属氧化物材料已成为目前超级电容器领域的研究热点.多级纳米结构不仅可以为电化学反应提供更多活性位点,同时还可以缩短离子的传输路径.本综述对多级纳米结构过渡金属氧化物在超级电容器电极材料方面的应用,进行了系统的总结与评价,主要包括:合成方法、成分、结构和电化学性能.此外,对该领域的进一步发展进行了展望.