DOI: 10.1007/s13226-018-0301-8

Corrections to Matrix polynomial generalizations of the sample variance-covariance matrix when $pn^{-1} \to y \in (0, \infty)$, Indian Journal of Pure and Applied Mathematics, 48(4) (2017), 575-607 by Monika Bhattacharjee and Arup Bose.

Statement of Theorem 4.2 is not correct as stated. The corrected statement (and its proof) is given below in Theorem C4.2. Lemma 4.3 was used to prove Theorem 4.2. Now this needs to be replaced by Lemma C4.3 given below. Specifically, texts between (4.11) and (4.22) and the proofs given in Sections 5.4 and 5.5 should be considered deleted. This does not affect any of the subsequent corollaries and consequences of Theorem 4.2. They continue to remain valid with the new Theorem C4.2.

Define

$$\bar{R}_{j,j_{1},j_{2},j_{3}}(\underline{f},\bar{\Pi}) = (1+y)\bar{\varphi}(\bar{\Pi}\bar{d}_{j_{1}}\bar{e}_{j_{3}}\bar{\delta}^{j-1})\underline{f}_{j_{2}}, \ R_{j,j_{1},j_{2},j_{3}}(f,\Pi) = \frac{1+y}{y}\bar{\varphi}(\bar{\Pi}\bar{d}_{j_{1}}\bar{e}_{j_{3}}\bar{\delta}^{j-1})f_{j_{2}},
\bar{A}_{j_{1},j_{2},j_{3}}(z,\underline{f},\bar{\Pi}) = \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} z^{-i}\bar{R}_{i,j_{1},j_{2},j_{3}}(\underline{f},\bar{\Pi}), \ A_{j_{1},j_{2},j_{3}}(z,f,\Pi) = \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} z^{-i}R_{i,j_{1},j_{2},j_{3}}(f,\Pi).$$

The following lemma guarantees existence of the above sums. Recall the states φ_{odd} and φ_{even} defined on the spaces \mathcal{A}_{odd} and $\mathcal{A}_{\text{even}}$ respectively. Clearly $\{d_j, e_j\}$ are in \mathcal{A}_{odd} and $\{f_j\}$ are in $\mathcal{A}_{\text{even}}$.

 $\begin{array}{l} \textit{Lemma} \ \mathsf{C4.3} - \mathsf{Suppose} \ \text{for all sufficiently large} \ |z|, z \in \mathbb{C}^+ \text{, and for some} \ C > 0 \text{, } |\varphi_{\mathsf{odd}}((\Pi\Pi^*)^r)| \\ \leq C^r \ \text{for all} \ r \geq 1. \ \text{Then} \ \bar{A}_{j_1,j_2,j_3}(z,\underline{f},\bar{\Pi}) \ \text{and} \ A_{j_1,j_2,j_3}(z,f,\Pi) \ \text{exist in the sense of} \ (4.10). \end{array}$

PROOF : There exists a C>0 such that for any $\{a_{2i-1}\}\in\{b_{2i-1},b_{2i-1}^*\}$, $\{a_{2i}\}\in\{b_{2i},b_{2i}^*\}$ and $h\geq 1$,

$$|\bar{\varphi}(\bar{a}_1\bar{a}_3\cdots\bar{a}_{2h-1})| \le C^h, \ |\bar{\varphi}(\underline{a}_2\underline{a}_4\cdots\underline{a}_{2h})| \le C^h, \ |\bar{\varphi}(\bar{\delta}^h)| \le C^h. \tag{1}$$

Proof of (1) is along the same lines as the proof of Carleman's condition (C) in Theorem 4.1. Hence

we omit it. Now by (1), for some $C_1 > 0$, we have

$$\begin{split} |\varphi_{\text{even}}((A_{j_1,j_2,j_3}(z,f,\Pi))^r)| & \leq & C_1 |\varphi_{\text{even}}(f_{j_2}^r)| \sum_{i_1,i_2,\dots,i_r=1}^{\infty} \big(\prod_{k=1}^r |z|^{-i_k} |\bar{\varphi}(\bar{\Pi}\bar{d}_{j_1}\bar{e}_{j_3}\bar{\delta}^{i_k-1})| \big) \\ & \leq & C_1 |\varphi_{\text{even}}(f_{j_2}^r)| (\bar{\varphi}(\bar{\Pi}\bar{\Pi}^*))^{r/2} (\bar{\varphi}((\bar{e}_{j_3}^*\bar{d}_{j_1}^*\bar{d}_{j_1}\bar{e}_{j_3})^2))^{r/4} \\ & \qquad \qquad \times \sum_{i_1,i_2,\dots,i_r=1}^{\infty} \big(\prod_{k=1}^r |z|^{-i_k} (\bar{\varphi}(\bar{\delta}^{4i_k-4}))^{1/4} \big) \\ & \leq & C_1 C^{3r} \sum_{i_1,i_2,\dots,i_r=1}^{\infty} \big(\prod_{k=1}^r |z|^{-i_k} C^{i_k} \big) \\ & = & C_1 C^{4r} (|z|-C)^{-r}, \text{ for sufficiently large } |z|. \end{split}$$

This completes the proof of the Lemma.

Theorem C4.2 — Assume (A1)-(A3) hold and $p, n \to \infty$, $p/n \to y > 0$.

(a) The following recursive relation holds:

$$\bar{A}_{j_{1},j_{2},j_{3}}(z,\underline{f},\bar{\Pi}) = \frac{1+y}{z} \left[\bar{\varphi}(\bar{\Pi}\bar{d}_{j_{1}}\bar{e}_{j_{3}}) \underline{f}_{j_{2}} + \sum_{t=1}^{\infty} \sum_{1} \bar{\varphi}(\bar{A}_{l_{0},l_{t-1},l_{t-1}}(z,\underline{f},\bar{\Pi}\bar{d}_{j_{1}}\bar{e}_{j_{3}}) \prod_{u=0}^{t-2} \bar{A}_{l_{u+1},l_{u},l_{u}}(z,\underline{f},1) \right) \underline{f}_{j_{2}} \right].$$
(2)

As a consequence, for $z\in\mathbb{C}^+$, |z| large, $m_{\bar{\mu}}(z)$ is given by

$$m_{\bar{\mu}}(z) = -\frac{1}{z} \left[1 + \sum_{t=1}^{\infty} \sum_{l} \bar{\varphi} \left(\prod_{u=1}^{t} \bar{A}_{l_{u}, l_{u-1}, l_{u-1}}(z, \underline{f}, 1) \right) \right]. \tag{3}$$

(b) The following recursive relation holds:

$$A_{j_{1},j_{2},j_{3}}(z,f,\Pi) = \frac{1}{z} \left[\varphi_{\text{odd}}(\Pi d_{j_{1}} e_{j_{3}}) f_{j_{2}} + \sum_{t=1}^{\infty} \sum_{1} y^{t-1} \varphi_{\text{even}} \left(A_{l_{0},l_{t-1},l_{t-1}}(z,f,\Pi d_{j_{1}} e_{j_{3}}) \prod_{u=0}^{t-2} A_{l_{u+1},l_{u},l_{u}}(z,f,1) \right) f_{j_{2}} \right].$$

$$(4)$$

As a consequence, for $z \in \mathbb{C}^+$, |z| large, $m_{\mu}(z)$ is given by

$$m_{\mu}(z) = -\frac{1}{z} \left[1 + \sum_{t=1}^{\infty} \sum_{l=1}^{\infty} y^{t-1} \varphi_{\text{even}} \left(\prod_{u=1}^{t} A_{l_{u}, l_{u-1}, l_{u-1}}(z, f, 1) \right) \right].$$
 (5)

PROOF: To prove the theorem we shall prove a lemma that provides expression for $\bar{\varphi}(\bar{\Pi}\bar{\delta}^r)$.

Define

$$\sum_{1} = \sum_{l_{0}, l_{1}, \dots, l_{t-1} = 1}^{q}, \quad \sum_{2} = \sum_{1 = k_{0} < k_{1} < k_{2} < \dots < k_{t-1} \le r},$$

$$\sum_{3} = \sum_{l_{1}, l_{2}, \dots, l_{r} = 1}^{q}, \quad \bar{d}_{l_{t}} = \bar{\Pi} \bar{d}_{l_{0}}, \quad k_{t} = r + 1.$$

Lemma 1 — Suppose (A1)-(A3) hold and $p, n = n(p) \to \infty$, $p/n \to y > 0$. Then

$$\bar{\varphi}(\bar{\Pi}\bar{\delta}^r) = \sum_{t=1}^r \sum_{l=1}^r \sum_{l=1}^r \sum_{l=1}^r \sum_{l=1}^r \sum_{l=1}^r \bar{\varphi}(\bar{e}_{l_u}\bar{\delta}^{k_{u+1}-k_u-1}\bar{d}_{l_{u+1}})\underline{f}_{l_u}). \tag{6}$$

PROOF: By Lemma C4.3, we have

$$\bar{\varphi}(\bar{\Pi}\bar{\delta}^r) = (1+y)^r \bar{\varphi}(\bar{\Pi}(\sum_{i=1}^q \bar{d}_i s \underline{f}_i s \bar{e}_i)^r)$$

$$= (1+y)^r \sum_{3} \bar{\varphi}(\bar{\Pi} \prod_{u=1}^r \bar{d}_{l_u} s \underline{f}_{l_u} s \bar{e}_{l_u}))$$

$$= (1+y)^r \sum_{3} \sum_{\sigma \in NC_2(2r)} \bar{\varphi}_{K(\sigma)}[\underline{f}_{l_1}, \bar{e}_{l_1} \bar{d}_{l_2}, \underline{f}_{l_2}, \bar{e}_{l_2} \bar{d}_{l_3}, \dots, \bar{e}_{l_r} \bar{\Pi} \bar{d}_{l_1}]$$

$$= \sum_{\sigma \in NC_2(2r)} \tau_{\sigma} \tag{7}$$

where $K(\sigma)$ is the Kreweras complement of σ (see Definition 9.21 in [1]) and

$$\tau_{\sigma} = (1+y)^r \sum_{3} \bar{\varphi}_{K(\sigma)}[\underline{f}_{l_1}, \bar{e}_{l_1} \bar{d}_{l_2}, \underline{f}_{l_2}, \bar{e}_{l_2} \bar{d}_{l_3}, \dots, \bar{e}_{l_r} \bar{\Pi} \bar{d}_{l_1}]. \tag{8}$$

Now to compute (7), we consider the decomposition of $NC_2(2r) = \bigcup_{t=1}^r \mathcal{P}_t^{2r}$, where

$$\mathcal{P}_1^{2r} = \{ \sigma \in NC_2(2r) : \{1, 2\} \in \sigma \}$$

and for all $2 \le t \le r$,

$$\mathcal{P}_{t}^{2r} = \{ \sigma \in NC_{2}(2r) : \sigma = \{2k_{0} - 1, 2k_{t-1}\}, \{2k_{0}, 2k_{1} - 1\}, \{2k_{1}, 2k_{2} - 1\}, \dots, \{2k_{t-2}, 2k_{t-1} - 1\}, 1 = k_{0} < k_{1} < \dots < k_{t-1} \le r \}.$$

Hence, (7) is equivalent to

$$\bar{\varphi}(\bar{\Pi}\bar{\delta}^r) = \sum_{t=1}^r \mathcal{T}_t,\tag{9}$$

where for all $1 \le t \le r$,

$$\mathcal{T}_{t} = \sum_{\sigma \in \mathcal{P}_{t}^{2r}} \tau_{\sigma} = (1+y)^{r} \sum_{\sigma \in \mathcal{P}_{t}^{2r}} \sum_{3} \bar{\varphi}_{K(\sigma)} [\underline{f}_{l_{1}}, \bar{e}_{l_{1}} \bar{d}_{l_{2}}, \underline{f}_{l_{2}}, \bar{e}_{l_{2}} \bar{d}_{l_{3}}, \dots, \bar{e}_{l_{r}} \bar{\Pi} \bar{d}_{l_{1}}]$$

$$= (1+y)^{t} \sum_{1} \sum_{2} \bar{\varphi} (\prod_{u=0}^{t-1} \underline{f}_{l_{u}}) \prod_{u=0}^{t-1} \bar{\varphi} (\bar{e}_{l_{u}} \bar{\delta}^{k_{u+1}-k_{u}-1} \bar{d}_{l_{u+1}})$$

$$= (1+y)^{t} \sum_{1} \sum_{2} \bar{\varphi} (\prod_{u=0}^{t-1} \bar{\varphi} (\bar{e}_{l_{u}} \bar{\delta}^{k_{u+1}-k_{u}-1} \bar{d}_{l_{u+1}}) \underline{f}_{l_{u}}). \tag{10}$$

Note $\sigma \in \mathcal{P}_t^{2r}$ implies that one block of $K(\sigma)$ is $\{2k_0-1,2k_1-1,\ldots,2k_{t-1}-1\}$ and its other blocks are subset of $\{2k_u,2k_u+1,\ldots,2k_{u+1}-2,\}:0\leq u\leq t-2$. Thus by using Lemma M5.1(b), above third equality holds. Moreover, recall (4.7) and note that each $\bar{\delta}$ involves one (1+y). In the third equality we have $\sum_{u=0}^{t-1}(K_{u+1}-k_u-1)=r-t$ many $\bar{\delta}$ and therefore they absorb $(1+y)^{r-t}$. Hence the lemma follows by (9) and (10).

PROOF OF (2):

$$\bar{A}_{j_1,j_2,j_3}(z,\underline{f},\bar{\Pi}) = \sum_{r=1}^{\infty} z^{-r} (1+y) \bar{\varphi}(\bar{\Pi} \bar{d}_{j_1} \bar{e}_{j_3} \bar{\delta}^{r-1}) \underline{f}_{j_2} = T_1 + T_2, \text{ (say)}$$
 (11)

where

$$T_1 = \frac{1+y}{z}\bar{\varphi}(\bar{\Pi}\bar{d}_{j_1}\bar{e}_{j_3})\underline{f}_{j_2}, \text{ and } T_2 = \sum_{r=1}^{\infty} z^{-(r+1)}(1+y)\bar{\varphi}(\bar{\Pi}\bar{d}_{j_1}\bar{e}_{j_3}\bar{\delta}^r)\underline{f}_{j_2}. \tag{12}$$

Let
$$\sum_4=\sum_{i_1,i_2,...,i_t=1}^\infty$$
 . Now by Lemma 1, $ar d_{l_t}=ar\Pi ar d_{j_1}ar e_{j_3}ar d_{l_0}$ and

$$\begin{split} T_2 &= \frac{1+y}{z} \sum_{r=1}^{\infty} \sum_{t=1}^{r} \sum_{1} \sum_{2} z^{-r} (1+y)^t \bar{\varphi} \Big(\prod_{u=0}^{t-1} \bar{\varphi}(\bar{e}_{l_u} \bar{\delta}^{k_{u+1}-k_u-1} \bar{d}_{l_{u+1}}) \underline{f}_{l_u} \Big) \underline{f}_{j_2} \\ &= \frac{1+y}{z} \sum_{t=1}^{\infty} \sum_{r=t}^{\infty} \sum_{1} \sum_{2} z^{-r} (1+y)^t \bar{\varphi} \Big(\prod_{u=0}^{t-1} \bar{\varphi}(\bar{e}_{l_u} \bar{\delta}^{k_{u+1}-k_u-1} \bar{d}_{l_{u+1}}) \underline{f}_{l_u} \Big) \underline{f}_{j_2} \\ &= \frac{1+y}{z} \sum_{t=1}^{\infty} \sum_{1} \sum_{1} \sum_{4} z^{-(i_1+i_2+\cdots+i_t)} (1+y)^t \bar{\varphi} \Big(\prod_{u=0}^{t-1} \bar{\varphi}(\bar{e}_{l_u} \bar{\delta}^{i_{u+1}-1} \bar{d}_{l_{u+1}}) \underline{f}_{l_u} \Big) \underline{f}_{j_2} \\ &= \frac{1+y}{z} \sum_{t=1}^{\infty} \sum_{1} \sum_{1} \bar{\varphi} \Big(\prod_{u=0}^{t-1} \sum_{i=t+1}^{\infty} z^{-i_{u+1}} (1+y) \bar{\varphi}(\bar{e}_{l_u} \bar{\delta}^{i_{u+1}-1} \bar{d}_{l_{u+1}}) \underline{f}_{l_u} \Big) \underline{f}_{j_2} \end{split}$$

$$= \frac{1+y}{z} \sum_{t=1}^{\infty} \sum_{1} \bar{\varphi} \Big(\sum_{i_{t}=1}^{\infty} z^{-i_{t}} \bar{R}_{i_{t},l_{0},l_{t-1},l_{t-1}} (\underline{f}, \bar{\Pi} \bar{d}_{j_{1}} \bar{e}_{j_{3}})$$

$$\prod_{u=0}^{t-2} \sum_{i_{u+1}=1}^{\infty} z^{-i_{u+1}} \bar{R}_{i_{u+1},l_{u+1},l_{u},l_{u}} (\underline{f}, 1) \Big)$$

$$= \frac{1+y}{z} \sum_{t=1}^{\infty} \sum_{1} \bar{\varphi} \Big(\bar{A}_{l_{0},l_{t-1},l_{t-1}} (z, \underline{f}, \bar{\Pi} \bar{d}_{j_{1}} \bar{e}_{j_{3}}) \prod_{u=0}^{t-2} \bar{A}_{l_{u+1},l_{u},l_{u}} (z, \underline{f}, 1) \Big).$$

$$(13)$$

Hence (2) is established by (11)-(13).

PROOF OF (3): Note that

$$m_{\bar{\mu}}(z) = \bar{\varphi}((\delta - z)^{-1}) = -\sum_{i=1}^{\infty} z^{-i} \bar{\varphi}(\bar{\delta}^{i-1}) = -(1+y)^{-1} \bar{A}_{0,0,0}(z,\underline{f},1).$$

Thus (3) follows by (2) and observing that $\bar{d}_0=1$, $\bar{e}_0=1$ and $\underline{f}_0=1$.

This completes the proof of the theorem C4.2(a).

PROOF OF (**b**): By (1), note that for any polynomials $\Pi_1, \Pi_2, \dots, \Pi_k$, of the same form as Π , we have

$$\begin{split} \bar{\varphi}(\prod_{k=1}^{r} \bar{R}_{j_{k},j_{1k},j_{2k},j_{3k}}(\underline{f},\bar{\Pi}_{k})) \\ &= (1+y)^{r} \bar{\varphi}(\underline{f}_{j_{21}}\underline{f}_{j_{22}}\cdots\underline{f}_{j_{2r}}) \prod_{k=1}^{r} \bar{\varphi}(\bar{\Pi}_{k}\bar{d}_{j_{1k}}\bar{e}_{j_{3k}}\bar{\delta}^{j_{k}-1}) \\ &= \frac{y^{r}}{1+y} \varphi_{\text{even}}(f_{j_{21}}f_{j_{22}}\cdots f_{j_{2r}}) \prod_{k=1}^{r} \left(\frac{1+y}{y} \bar{\varphi}(\bar{\Pi}_{k}\bar{d}_{j_{1k}}\bar{e}_{j_{3k}}\bar{\delta}^{j_{k}-1})\right) \\ &= \frac{y^{r}}{1+y} \varphi_{\text{even}}(\prod_{k=1}^{r} R_{j_{k},j_{1k},j_{2k},j_{3k}}(f,\Pi_{k})). \end{split}$$

Thus

$$\bar{\varphi}(\prod_{k=1}^r \bar{A}_{j_{1k},j_{2k}j_{3k}}(z,\underline{f},\bar{\Pi}_k)) = \frac{y^r}{1+y}\varphi_{\text{even}}(\prod_{k=1}^r A_{j_{1k},j_{2k}j_{3k}}(z,f,\Pi_k)). \tag{14}$$

Therefore, by (2) and (14), we have

$$\bar{A}_{j_{1},j_{2},j_{3}}(z,\underline{f},\bar{\Pi}) = \frac{1}{z} \left[y \varphi_{\text{odd}}(\Pi d_{j_{1}} e_{j_{3}}) \underline{f}_{j_{2}} + \sum_{t=1}^{\infty} \sum_{l=1}^{\infty} y^{t} \varphi_{\text{even}} \left(A_{l_{0},l_{t-1},l_{t-1}}(z,f,\Pi d_{j_{1}} e_{j_{3}}) \prod_{u=0}^{t-2} A_{l_{u+1},l_{u},l_{u}}(z,f,1) \right) \underline{f}_{j_{2}} \right].$$
(15)

Hence, (4) follows from the above equation and (1).

Now by (4.9), (3) and (14), we have

$$\frac{y}{1+y}m_{\mu}(z) - \frac{1}{1+y}\frac{1}{z} = -\frac{1}{z}\Big[1 + \sum_{t=1}^{\infty}\sum_{1}\frac{y^{t}}{1+y}\varphi_{\mathrm{even}}\big(\prod_{u=1}^{t}A_{l_{u},l_{u-1},l_{u-1}}(z,f,1)\big)\Big].$$

Simplifying the above equation,

$$m_{\mu}(z) = -\frac{1}{z} \big[1 + \sum_{t=1}^{\infty} \sum_{1} y^{t-1} \varphi_{\mathrm{even}} \big(\prod_{u=1}^{t} A_{l_{u}, l_{u-1}, l_{u-1}}(z, f, 1) \big) \big].$$

This establishes (5) and hence completes the proof of Theorem C4.2.

REFERENCE

1. A. Nica and R. Speicher, *Lectures on the combinatorics of free probability*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK, 2006.