Erratum to: Policies against human trafficking: the role of religion and political institutions

Niklas Potrafke^{1,2}

Published online: 16 September 2016
© Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg 2016

Erratum to: Econ Gov DOI 10.1007/s10101-016-0181-5

The author declares that he used the explanatory variables averaged over the period 1999–2010 instead of the period 2000–2010. Inferences do not change when the explanatory variables averaged over the period 2000–2010 were used.

Please find the corrected Tables 1, 2, 5 and 6 in this erratum.

The online version of the original article can be found under doi:[10.1007/s10101-016-0181-5](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10101-016-0181-5).

✉ Niklas Potrafke
potrafke@ifo.de

¹ Department of Economics, University of Munich, Schackstr. 4/I, 80539 Munich, Germany

² ifo Center for Public Finance and Political Economy, ifo Institute, Poschingerstr. 5, 81679 Munich, Germany

Table 1 Regression results. Dependent variable: 3P Anti-trafficking Index OLS with robust standard errors

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
	Types of religion	Types of religion	Excluding India	Muslim/Christian
Muslims	−0.0125** (−2.09)	−0.0200*** (−2.92)	−0.0208*** (−2.98)	−0.0195*** (−2.96)
Buddhists	0.0165 (1.42)	0.00488 (0.42)	0.00297 (0.26)	
Hindus	0.0285** (2.16)	0.0367** (2.06)	0.0255 (1.16)	
Traditional religions	0.00589 (0.40)	0.00294 (0.21)	0.00218 (0.16)	
Others	−0.00278 (−0.13)	−0.0269* (−1.70)	−0.0294* (−1.85)	
Others (including Buddhists etc.)				−0.00260 (−0.30)
Democracy (Cheibub et al. 2010)	2.720*** (4.35)	1.066 (1.58)	0.901 (1.32)	1.102 (1.63)
Muslims*Democracy	0.00532 (0.60)	0.0165 (1.65)	0.0169* (1.68)	0.0152 (1.53)
Buddhists*Democracy	−0.0173 (−0.98)	−0.0119 (−0.55)	−0.0138 (−0.63)	
Hindus*Democracy	−0.0448** (−2.24)	−0.0471 (−1.64)	−0.00689 (−0.21)	
Traditional religions *Democracy	−0.0468** (−2.49)	−0.0100 (−0.61)	−0.00669 (−0.41)	
Other*Democracy	0.0162 (0.61)	0.0236 (1.38)	0.0262 (1.54)	
Other (including Buddhism etc.) *Democracy				−0.00148 (−0.14)
Asia		0.396 (0.74)	0.533 (1.02)	0.577 (1.24)
Europe		0.725 (1.01)	0.884 (1.27)	1.092 (1.64)
America		−0.363 (−0.58)	−0.265 (−0.43)	−0.238 (−0.38)

Table 1 continued

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
	Types of religion	Types of religion	Excluding India	Muslim/Christian
Oceania		−1.070 (−1.26)	−0.879 (−1.03)	−0.906 (−1.14)
Legal origin (french)		0.314 (1.12)	0.265 (0.96)	0.225 (0.81)
Legal origin (socialist)		1.133** (2.09)	1.064** (2.02)	0.734 (1.40)
Legal origin (german)		0.0737 (0.09)	0.0725 (0.09)	0.0265 (0.03)
Legal origin (scandinavian)		0.117 (0.17)	0.125 (0.18)	−0.0798 (−0.11)
log per capita GDP		−0.0345 (−0.16)	−0.0465 (−0.22)	−0.144 (−0.72)
log Population		0.494*** (5.56)	0.530*** (5.84)	0.445*** (5.20)
OECD		0.687 (1.30)	0.635 (1.21)	0.847 (1.65)
Women's Economic Rights		0.356 (1.01)	0.385 (1.11)	0.456 (1.35)
Absence of corruption		0.368*** (2.86)	0.370*** (2.88)	0.332** (2.59)
Oil production value		−0.0230 (−0.47)	−0.0291 (−0.60)	−0.0146 (−0.31)
Constant	7.755*** (15.27)	2.392 (1.24)	2.207 (1.15)	3.635** (2.04)
Observations	175	168	167	168
R-squared	0.406	0.735	0.741	0.719

Religious reference: Christianity

Absolute value of t statistics in brackets; * significant at 10 %; ** significant at 5 %; *** significant at 1 %

Table 2 Regression results

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
	Religiosity incl.	Protestants	Catholics	POLITY IV
Muslims	−0.0148* (−1.94)	−0.0178** (−2.14)	−0.0184* (−1.78)	−0.0136** (−2.30)
Protestants		0.00232 (0.14)		
Catholics			0.00179 (0.13)	
Others	0.000995 (0.11)	−0.00162 (−0.16)	−0.00269 (−0.23)	−0.00453 (−0.65)
Democracy (Cheibub et al. 2010)	1.568** (2.10)	1.599* (1.96)	0.377 (0.44)	
Democracy (POLITY IV)				0.0971 (1.30)
Muslims*Democracy (Cheibub)	0.00754 (0.71)	0.0105 (0.96)	0.0240** (2.16)	
Protestants*Democracy (Cheibub)		−0.0223 (−1.22)		
Catholics*Democracy (Cheibub)			0.0124 (0.86)	
Others*Democracy (Cheibub)	−0.00527 (−0.46)	−0.00438 (−0.37)	0.00750 (0.58)	
Muslims*Democracy (POLITY IV)				0.000631 (0.69)
Others*Democracy (POLITY IV)				−0.000188 (−0.19)
Asia	0.729 (1.59)	0.483 (1.02)	0.532 (1.15)	0.968* (1.80)
Europe	1.543** (2.20)	0.992 (1.44)	1.078 (1.57)	1.167 (1.57)
America	0.213 (0.33)	−0.236 (−0.38)	−0.457 (−0.69)	0.0846 (0.12)

Table 2 continued

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
	Religiosity incl.	Protestants	Catholics	POLITY IV
Oceania	1.570 (1.58)	−0.567 (−0.80)	−0.818 (−0.98)	−1.003 (−1.07)
Legal origin (french)	0.0136 (0.05)	0.0456 (0.15)	0.00489 (0.02)	0.137 (0.41)
Legal origin (socialist)	0.880 (1.53)	0.755 (1.48)	0.795 (1.53)	0.635 (1.18)
Legal origin (german)	0.340 (0.44)	0.185 (0.21)	0.0838 (0.10)	0.0631 (0.08)
Legal origin (scandinavian)	0.0494 (0.06)	1.071 (1.28)	0.599 (0.80)	−0.159 (−0.22)
log per capita GDP	−0.307 (−1.43)	−0.256 (−1.24)	−0.200 (−1.01)	−0.268 (−1.09)
log Population	0.350*** (3.67)	0.421*** (5.01)	0.434*** (4.90)	0.336*** (3.26)
OECD	0.816 (1.60)	0.883* (1.71)	0.699 (1.33)	0.846 (1.57)
Women's Economic Rights	0.351 (0.97)	0.417 (1.20)	0.459 (1.39)	0.631* (1.69)
Absence of corruption	0.424*** (2.97)	0.413*** (3.15)	0.362*** (2.93)	0.368*** (2.64)
Oil production value	−0.00396 (−0.07)	0.0162 (0.33)	0.00152 (0.03)	0.0223 (0.39)
Religiosity	1.427 (1.51)			
Constant	4.118* (1.89)	4.444** (2.44)	4.086** (2.06)	5.456*** (2.61)
Observations	148	168	168	155
R-squared	0.723	0.728	0.728	0.698

Dependent variable: 3P Anti-trafficking Index OLS with robust standard errors

Absolute value of t statistics in brackets; * significant at 10 %; ** significant at 5 %; *** significant at 1 %

Table 5 List of countries included

Country	3P	Christi- anity	Islam	Demo- cracy	Country	3P	Christi- anity	Islam	Demo- cracy
Afghanistan	6.7	0	89	0	Colombia	11.9	93	0	1
Albania	11.5	33	65	1	Comoros	6	0.6	99	0.56
Algeria	4.6	0.4	99	0	Congo	7	78	1	0
Angola	7.4	90	0	0	Costa Rica	9.5	88	0	1
Antigua and Barbuda	8.7	96	0	1	Cote d'Ivoire	7.8	20	20	0
Argentina	9.9	95	0	1	Croatia	12.2	89	1	1
Armenia	10.1	97	3	1	Cuba	4.2	36	0	0
Australia	14.1	74	0	1	Cyprus	10.3	78	19	1
Austria	13.7	88	2	1	Czech Republic	12.5	48	0	1
Azerbaijan	8.9	11	80	0	Democratic Peo- ple's Republic of Korea	3	0.9	0	0
Bahamas	6.2	83	0	1	Democratic Repub- lic of the Congo	7.3	94	1	0
Bahrain	6.8	7	90	0	Denmark	13.7	89	1	1
Bangladesh	11.1	0	87	0.78	Djibouti	6.1	5	94	0
Barbados	5.8	59	0	1	Dominican Republic	9.1	92	0	1
Belarus	9.5	68	0	0	Ecuador	9.9	92	0	0.78
Belgium	14.5	79	3	1	Egypt	5.9	10	88	0
Belize	8.9	89	0	1	El Salvador	9.9	92	0	1
Benin	9.5	23	13	1	Equatorial Guinea	7.7	85	0.5	0
Bolivia	8.7	93	0	1	Eritrea	4	20	80	0
Bosnia and Herzegovina	11	52	43	0	Estonia	8.9	100	0	1
Botswana	6.8	48	0	0	Ethiopia	9.7	53	32	0
Brazil	11	78	0	1	Fiji	7.2	52	8	0
Brunei Darussalam	5.7	10	63	0	Finland	11.9	88	0	1
Bulgaria	11	78	13	1	France	12.7	82	3	1
Burkina Faso	9.5	12	42	0	Gabon	10.2	96	0.8	0
Burundi	7.7	79	1	0.44	Gambia	7.6	4	94	0
Cambodia	9.2	0	2	0	Georgia	10.2	83	11	0.56
Cameroon	7.6	52	22	0	Germany	14.6	61	2	1
Canada	12.6	87	0.400	1	Ghana	9.8	62	16	1
Central African Republic	6.5	69	8	0.33	Greece	9.8	98	2	1
Chad	6.9	33	43	0	Guatemala	10.1	98	0	1
Chile	11.1	87	0	1	Guinea	8.5	2	80	0
China	10.3	0.2	2	0	Guinea Bissau	7.7	6	34	0.89

Table 5 continued

Country	3P	Christi- anity	Islam	Demo- cracy	Country	3P	Christi- anity	Islam	Demo- cracy
Guyana	9	41	0	0	Malta	9.4	97	0	1
Haiti	6	94	0	0	Mauritania	7.3	0.4	99	0.11
Honduras	8.9	98	0	1	Mauritius	10.9	30	13	1
Hungary	10.6	82	0	1	Mexico	9	96	0	1
Iceland	10.3	97	0	1	Mongolia	9	0	1	1
India	9.5	2	11	1	Montenegro	9.5	70	19	0
Indonesia	9	9	81	1	Morocco	9	1	99	0
Iran	6.3	0.7	98	0	Mozambique	8.4	31	13	0
Iraq	4.1	4	94	0	Myanmar	7	5	4	0
Ireland	11.7	96	0	1	Namibia	7.5	82	0	0
Israel	10.4	2	10	1	Nepal	10.3	0.2	3	0.33
Italy	13.8	82	0	1	Netherlands	14.2	62	3	1
Jamaica	9.3	58	0	1	New Zealand	12.1	63	0	1
Japan	9.5	2	0	1	Nicaragua	9.1	92	0	1
Jordan	7.3	5	92	0	Nigeria	11	49	45	1
Kazakhstan	9.7	17	47	0	Niger	8.6	0	90	1
Kenya	9	73	6	1	Norway	14.3	92	0	1
Kiribati	4.75	95	0	1	Oman	7.9	0	87	0
Kuwait	6.3	0	85	0	Pakistan	9.3	2	97	0.11
Kyrgyzstan	8.9	20	70	0.44	Panama	10.1	89	5	1
Lao People's Democratic Republic	9.2	2	1	0	Papua New Guinea	6.2	91	0	1
Latvia	10.7	65	0	1	Paraguay	9.8	98	0	1
Lebanon	6	15	50	0	Peru	9.5	98	0	0.89
Lesotho	7	93	0	0	Philippines	11.5	88	4	1
Liberia	7.4	67	14	0.33	Poland	12.5	90	0	1
Libya	4.6	0	97	0	Portugal	12.6	94	0.1	1
Lithuania	12.4	95	0	1	Qatar	6.1	6	92	0
Luxembourg	12.4	93	0	1	Republic of Korea	13.3	33	0	1
Macedonia	11.6	64	26	1	Republic of Moldova	9.6	97	0	1
Madagascar	8.8	50	3	1	Romania	11.4	90	0.2	1
Malawi	10.7	64	16	1	Russian Federa- tion	9.1	84	5	0
Malaysia	7.9	6	53	0	Rwanda	9.6	74	9	0
Maldives	4.7	0	100	0.11	Saint Vincent and the Grenadines	6.3	90	0	1
Mali	8.3	1	89	1	Saint Lucia	8	95	0	1

Table 5 continued

Country	3P	Christi- anity	Islam	Demo- cracy	Country	3P	Christi- anity	Islam	Demo- cracy
Saudi Arabia	6.3	0.8	99	0	Thailand	11.8	1	4	0.78
Senegal	9.6	5	91	1	Togo	8.1	35	12	0
Serbia	9.1	70	19	1	Tonga	6	93	0	0
Seychelles	6	97	0	0	Trinidad and Tobago	7	55	6	1
Sierra Leone	7.6	8	39	1	Tunisia	5.9	0.3	99	0
Singapore	8.8	16	16	0	Turkey	10.2	0.3	99	1
Slovakia	10.6	80	0	1	Turkmenistan	4.2	11	87	0
Slovenia	11.9	96	1	1	Uganda	8.3	76	7	0
Solomon Islands	4	93	0	1	Ukraine	10.3	90	8	1
Somalia	3.2	0.1	100	0	United Arab Emirates	8.7	4	95	0
South Africa	7.4	68	1	0	United Kingdom	13.1	87	1	1
Spain	13.6	96	0	1	United Republic of Tanzania	8.8	34	33	0
Sri Lanka	9.5	8	8	1	United States	15	62	2	1
Sudan	4.5	8	73	0	Uruguay	9.9	62	0	1
Suriname	8.4	41	20	1	Uzbekistan	9.6	9	88	0
Swaziland	6.4	77	0	0	Venezuela	7.3	91	0	1
Sweden	13.7	80	0	1	Viet Nam	11.1	7	0	0
Switzerland	12.4	92	2	1	Yemen	7.1	0	100	0
Syria	5.6	8	90	0	Zambia	10	69	0.300	0
Taiwan	10.2	7	0.5	1	Zimbabwe	7.3	43	0	0
Tajikistan	9.3	0	85	0	Total	9	51.59	25.57	0.56

Table 6 Data description and sources

Variable	Observations	Mean	Std. Dev.	Min	Max	Source
3P index (prosecution)	175	3.35	1.07	1	5	Cho et al. (2014)
3P index (protection)	175	2.64	0.89	1	5	Cho et al. (2014)
3P index (prevention)	175	3.05	0.83	1	5	Cho et al. (2014)
3P index (overall)	175	9.04	2.54	3	15	Cho et al. (2014)
Democracy	175	0.56	0.48	0	1	Cheibub et al. (2010)
Anglicans share	175	2.31	8.11	0	57	Parker (1997)
Buddhists share	175	3.59	14.93	0	92	Parker (1997)
Christians share	175	51.59	38.03	0	100	Parker (1997)
Hindus share	175	2.36	10.84	0	86	Parker (1997)
Jews share	175	0.58	6.35	0	84	Parker (1997)
Muslims share	175	25.57	36.82	0	100	Parker (1997)
Protestants share	175	13.86	23.06	0	100	Parker (1997)
Roman Catholics share	175	27.54	34.25	0	97	Parker (1997)
Traditional religions share	175	5.60	12.67	0	63	Parker (1997)
Christian majority	175	0.59	0.49	0	1	CIA World Factbook (2013)
Muslim majority	175	0.29	0.45	0	1	CIA World Factbook (2013)
Hindu majority	175	0.02	0.15	0	1	CIA World Factbook (2013)
Buddhist majority	175	0.05	0.21	0	1	CIA World Factbook (2013)
Jewish majority	175	0.01	0.08	0	1	CIA World Factbook (2013)
Indigenous majority	175	0.05	0.21	0	1	CIA World Factbook (2013)
Religiosity	152	0.72	0.25	0.15	1	Berggren & Bjørnskov (2013)
British legal origin	173	0.31	0.46	0	1	La Porta et al. (1999)
French legal origin	173	0.43	0.50	0	1	La Porta et al. (1999)
Socialist legal origin	173	0.20	0.40	0	1	La Porta et al. (1999)
German legal origin	173	0.03	0.18	0	1	La Porta et al. (1999)
Scandinavian legal origin	173	0.03	0.17	0	1	La Porta et al. (1999)

Table 6 continued

Variable	Observations	Mean	Std. Dev.	Min	Max	Source
Africa	175	0.29	0.46	0	1	own calculation
Americas	175	0.18	0.39	0	1	own calculation
Asia	175	0.26	0.44	0	1	own calculation
Europe	175	0.23	0.42	0	1	own calculation
Oceania	175	0.04	0.20	0	1	own calculation
OECD	175	0.17	0.38	0	1	own calculation
Population	173	36846.00	132687.15	81.20	1297335.50	PENN World Table 7.1 –, Summers & Heston (1991)
Real GDP per capita	173	12014.37	14572.09	208.40	84452.09	PENN World Table 7.1 – Summers & Heston (1991)
Oil production value per capita	174	700.62	2483.07	0	19269.50	EIA (2012), own calculation
Democracy (type2)	175	0.78	0.39	0	1	Cheibub et al. (2010)
POLITY IV index	160	3.42	6.32	–10	10	Marshall & Jaggers (2011)
POLITY IV executive constraints	145	4.89	2.01	1	7	Marshall & Jaggers (2011)
KOF index of globalization (overall)	171	55.81	16.96	21.99	92.43	Dreher (2006); Dreher et al. (2008)
KOF index of globalization (economic)	146	60.49	16.87	26.40	96.27	Dreher (2006); Dreher et al. (2008)
KOF index of globalization (social)	171	47.59	21.79	12.31	92.18	Dreher (2006); Dreher et al. (2008)
KOF index of globalization (political)	174	64.57	20.34	20.69	97.30	Dreher (2006); Dreher et al. (2008)
Absence of corruption	172	3.97	2.09	1.33	9.52	Transparency International (2012)
Women's economic rights	175	1.30	0.60	0	3	Cingranelli & Richards (2010)
Trafficking (transit)	150	1.44	1.51	0	5	UNODC (2006)
Net migration flows	171	–797.58	686460.99	–1917599.62	6557193.00	Worldbank (2011)
Migrant stock	174	7.66	12.04	0.05	80.24	Worldbank (2011)