

Do physical diagnostic tests accurately detect meniscal tears?

Sujith Konan · Fares S. Haddad

Received: 14 January 2010 / Accepted: 8 February 2011 / Published online: 3 March 2011
© Springer-Verlag 2011

Dear Editors,

Thank you for your comment. We would like to congratulate Karachalios et al. [1] on the development of ‘The Thessaly Test’. This new test is user friendly and adds to the available array of diagnostic tests for detection of meniscus tears.

While the points raised here are valid, they have already been discussed in our paper [2].

The fact that our study is a cohort study is evident from our methodology. The study was not designed to have a control group as a prospective randomized study. It was designed to assess a group of meniscal tears to see which tests were positive when there was a high likelihood that the test should be positive.

The smaller study numbers and their effect on diagnosis in the presence of confounding knee injuries have been stated in the first paragraph of our discussion.

The possibility of selection bias has also been addressed in our discussion.

The study described by Karachalios et al. [1] was based on careful patient selection. The reality is that it does not

reflect standard clinical practice. We have attempted the study in a clinical setting where patients may have confounding injuries. We believe that multiple factors have to be considered prior to the diagnosis of a meniscus tear. Various diagnostic tests and investigations help in the clinical decision analysis. They should be commended on a robust defense of their test but they should learn to accept its limitations.

The sole use of any single diagnostic test as a selection tool for arthroscopic intervention cannot be supported based on currently available studies.

References

1. Karachalios T, Hantes M, Zibis AH, Zachos V, Karantanas AH, Malizos KN (2005) Diagnostic accuracy of a new clinical test (the Thessaly test) for early detection of meniscal tears. *J Bone Joint Surg Am* 87:955–962
2. Konan S, Rayan F, Haddad FS (2009) Do physical diagnostic tests accurately detect meniscal tears? *Knee Surg Sports Traumatol Arthrosc* 17:806–811

S. Konan (✉)
SpR Trauma & Orthopaedics, University College Hospital,
London WC1, UK
e-mail: docsujith@yahoo.co.uk

F. S. Haddad
University College Hospital, London WC1, UK