



## Reply to Michael Harrington

Joseph A. Adler<sup>1</sup>

Published online: 2 December 2019  
© Springer Nature B.V. 2019

Instead of going through Mr. Michael Harrington's response point by point, I think one example will suffice. Mr. Harrington's claim, "Prognostication, understood not as divination but as the warnings of the sage, is central to the meaning of the hexagram statements, and so 'center' is an acceptable translation of *zhong* 中 on 19," is wrong on two counts. First, "prognostication" (*zhan* 占) unambiguously refers to divination. Second, *zai qi zhong* 在其中 is a very common idiom (as I pointed out) that could accurately be translated as "lies herein," but in context suggests a fortunate by-product of what is really important. Its first instance in the *Analects* (2.18) is a perfect example: in D. C. Lau's translation, "When in your speech you make few mistakes and in your action you have few regrets, an official career [or "emolument," *lu* 祿] will follow as a matter of course [*zai qi zhong*]" (D. C. Lau, trans., *The Analects* [London: Penguin, 1979], p. 65). In other words, speaking and acting properly are inherent goods that will secondarily advance your career, but career and salary should not be their motivation; hence they are *not* central. By translating CHENG Yi's phrase literally ("lie at their center") Harrington not only fails to recognize the common idiom but contradicts a fundamental aspect of CHENG Yi's 程頤 interpretive theory, which is that the images (*xiang* 象) and prognostications (*zhan*) of the *Yi* do *not* carry its central meaning. So in this one sentence we see both major points of my review: an inexperienced translator of classical Chinese texts whose laser focus on the text itself blinds him to the importance of context in understanding a book such as CHENG Yi's commentary on the *Yijing*.

**Publisher's Note** Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

---

✉ Joseph A. Adler  
adlerj@kenyon.edu

<sup>1</sup> Department of Religious Studies and Asian Studies Program, Kenyon College, Gambier, OH 43022, USA