Multimed Tools Appl (2015) 74:5617–5621
DOI 10.1007/s11042-014-2012-4

ERRATUM

Erratum to: A survey on facial expression recognition in 3D video sequences

Antonios Danelakis · Theoharis Theoharis · Ioannis Pratikakis

Published online: 17 May 2014

Erratum to: Multimed Tools Appl
DOI 10.1007/s11042-014-1869-6

The authors cited incorrect data in Tables 6, 7, and 9 in the paper entitled "A survey on facial expression recognition in 3D video sequences" by Antonios Danelakis, Theoharis Theoharis, Ioannis Pratikakis, published online first 1 February 2014. Additionally, every reference to "László et al." should become "Jeni et al.". The authors apologize for these errors.

In Table 6: In the row concerning Yin *et al.* and in the column titled "Classification Accuracy" (2*nd* column), the word 'N/A' should be changed to '80.20 %'.

The online version of the original article can be found at http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s11042-014-1869-6.

A. Danelakis (✉) · T. Theoharis
Department of Informatics and Telecommunications, National and Kapodistrian University of Athens, Athens, Greece
e-mail: a.danelakis@gmail.com

T. Theoharis
Department of Computer and Information Science, Norwegian University of Science and Technology, Trondheim, Norway
e-mail: theotheo@idi.ntnu.no; theotheo@di.uoa.gr

I. Pratikakis
Department of Electrical and Computer Engineering, Democritus University of Thrace, Thrace, Greece
e-mail: ipratika@ee.duth.gr

Table 7 appears correctly with references listed below:

Table 7 Comparison of methodologies using BU - 4DFE dataset

Method	Classification accuracy	Confusion matrix (%)	Angry	Disgust	Fear	Happy	Sad	Surprise
Sun et al. [36]	94.37 %	Angry	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
		Disgust	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
		Fear	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
		Happy	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
		Sad	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
		Surprise	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Canavan et al. [8]	84.80 %	Angry	83.60	5.50	4.90	0.00	3.80	2.20
		Disgust	5.10	83.20	5.80	0.00	3.30	2.60
		Fear	1.70	3.20	81.30	7.50	4.20	2.10
		Fear	1.10	2.10	0.00	92.10	0.00	4.70
		Sad	4.20	8.60	9.20	0.00	78.00	0.00
		Surprise	1.10	1.90	3.60	3.90	0.00	89.50
Berretti et al. [4]	76.30 %	Angry	83.75	X	X	11.25	X	5.00
		Disgust	X	X	X	X	X	X
		Fear	X	X	X	X	X	X
		Happy	17.50	X	X	75.00	X	7.50
		Sad	X	X	X	X	X	X
		Surprise	13.75	X	X	16.25	X	70.00
Jeni et al. [26]	78.18 %	Surprise	82.10	10.30	0.00	0.00	7.70	0.00
		Disgust	12.08	74.40	2.60	7.70	2.60	0.00
		Fear	0.00	5.10	61.50	7.70	15.40	10.30
		Happy	2.60	5.10	5.10	87.20	0.00	0.00
		Sad	17.90	2.60	5.10	2.60	71.80	0.00
		Surprise	0.00	0.00	7.90	0.00	0.00	92.10
Sandbach et al. [31]	81.93 %	Angry	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
		Disgust	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
		Fear	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
		Happy	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
		Sad	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
		Surprise	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Sandbach et al. [32]	64.46 %	Angry	51.92	11.54	5.77	0.00	28.85	1.92
		Disgust	16.95	62.71	6.78	3.39	5.08	5.08
		Fear	10.26	5.13	46.15	10.26	15.38	12.82
		Happy	1.12	6.74	10.11	75.28	2.25	4.49
		Sad	17.24	5.17	3.45	1.72	68.97	3.45
		Surprise	4.65	2.33	3.49	2.33	4.65	82.56
Fang et al. [18]	75.82 %	Angry	68.31	11.17	3.11	1.11	16.31	0.00
		Disgust	7.47	79.69	3.00	3.92	2.67	3.25
		Fear	11.28	3.47	67.89	6.81	7.08	3.48
		Happy	3.97	3.97	9.51	81.31	0.00	1.25

Table 7 (continued)

Method	Classification accuracy	Confusion matrix (%)	Angry	Disgust	Fear	Happy	Sad	Surprise
		Sad	23.00	0.00	4.36	0.00	71.64	1.00
		Surprise	0.00	0.00	8.51	2.86	2.54	86.10
Fang et al. [17]	91.00 %	Angry	92.42	0.76	0.00	0.00	6.82	0.00
		Disgust	3.03	91.67	3.03	0.00	0.00	2.27
		Fear	5.30	4.55	81.06	2.27	4.55	2.27
		Happy	0.00	0.00	1.52	98.48	0.00	0.00
		Sad	8.33	1.52	1.52	0.00	88.64	0.00
		Surprise	0.00	0.00	5.3	0.76	0.00	93.94
Le et al. [27]	92.22 %	Angry	X	X	X	X	X	X
		Disgust	X	X	X	X	X	X
		Fear	X	X	X	X	X	X
		Happy	X	X	X	95.00	3.00	1.00
		Angry	X	X	X	1.00	91.00	6.00
		Surprise	X	X	X	0.00	10.00	90.00
Drira et al. [14]	93.21 %	Angry	93.11	2.42	1.71	0.46	1.61	0.66
		Disgust	2.30	92.46	2.44	0.92	1.27	0.58
		Fear	1.89	1.75	91.24	1.50	1.76	1.83
		Happy	0.57	0.84	1.71	95.47	0.77	0.62
		Sad	1.70	1.52	2.01	1.09	92.46	1.19
		Surprise	0.71	0.85	1.84	0.72	1.33	94.53
Zhang et al. [46]	76.12 %	Angry	71.10	11.84	3.94	2.63	9.12	1.31
		Disgust	7.79	64.90	16.88	5.19	0.00	5.19
		Fear	3.52	9.41	64.7	8.23	7.05	7.05
		Happy	2,63	0.00	2.63	93.40	0.00	1.31
		Sad	17.72	1.26	5.06	1.26	73.40	1.26
		Surprise	1.13	3.4	3.40	1.13	2.27	88.60

References

[4] Berretti S, Del Bimbo A, Pala P (2012) Real-time expression recognition from dynamic sequences of 3D facial scans. In: EG Workshop on 3D Object Retrieval, pp. 85-92

[8] Canavan SJ, Sun Y, Zhang X, Yin L (2012) A dynamic curvature based approach for facial activity analysis in 3D space. In: CVPR Workshops, pp. 14-19

[14] Drira H, Ben Amor B, Daoudi M, Srivastava A, Berretti S (2012) 3D dynamic expression recognition based on a novel deformation vector field and random forest. In: ICPR '12, pp. 1104-1107

[17] Fang T, Zhao X, Ocegueda O, Shah SK, Kakadiaris IA (2012) 3D/4D facial expression analysis: An advanced annotated face model approach. Elsevier Image Vis Comput 30(10):738–749

[18] Fang T, Zhao X, Shah SK, Kakadiaris IA (2011) 4D facial expression recognition. In: ICCV '11, pp. 1594-1601

[26] Jeni LA, Lórincz A, Nagy T, Palotai Z, Sebók J, Szabó Z, Takács D (2012) 3D shape estimation in video sequences provides high precision evaluation of facial expressions. Elsevier Image Vis Comput 30(10):785–795

[27] Le V, Tang H, Huang TS (2011) Expression recognition from 3D dynamic faces using robust spatio-temporal shape features. In: IEEE FG '11, pp. 414-421

[31] Sandbach G, Zafeiriou S, Pantic M, Rueckert D (2011) A dynamic approach to the recognition of 3D facial expressions and their temporal models. In: IEEE FG '11, pp. 406-413

[32] Sandbach G, Zafeiriou S, Pantic M, Rueckert D (2012) Recognition of 3D facial expression dynamics. Elsevier Image Vis Comput 30(10):762–773

[36] Sun Y, Chen X, Rosato MJ, Yin L (2010) Tracking vertex flow and model adaptation for three-dimensional spatiotemporal face analysis. IEEE Trans Syst Man Cybern Part A 40(3):461–474

[46] Zhang X, Reale M, Yin L (2013) Nebula feature: A space-time feature for posed and spontaneous 4D facial behavior analysis. In: IEEE FG '13

Table 9 appears correctly with references listed below:

Table 9 Classification accuracy of the methods with respect to facial expressions

Method	Angry	Disgust	Fear	Happy	Sad	Surprise
Chang et al. [9]	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Rosato et al. [29]	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Sun et al. [36]	94.12 %	94.09 %	94.45 %	94.52 %	93.87 %	95.02 %
Tsalakanidou et al. [39]	X	81.47 %	X	90.43 %	73.36 %	86.67 %
Tsalakanidou et al. [40]	X	89.37 %	X	95.06 %	79.24 %	93.90 %
Sun et al. [38]	92.44 %	87.58 %	85.40 %	97.81 %	80.32 %	99.34 %
Canavan et al. [8]	83.60 %	83.20 %	81.30 %	92.10 %	78.00 %	89.50 %
Berretti et al. [4]	83.75 %	X	X	75.00 %	X	70.00 %
Jeni et al. [26]	82.10 %	74.40 %	61.50 %	87.20 %	71.80 %	92.10 %
Yin et al. [43]	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Sandbach et al. [32]	51.92 %	62.71 %	46.15 %	75.28 %	68.97 %	82.56 %
Sandbach et al. [31]	75.00 %	X	X	88.75 %	X	82.05 %
Fang et al. [18]	68.31 %	79.69 %	67.89 %	81.31 %	71.64 %	86.10 %
Fang et al. [17]	92.42 %	91.67 %	81.06 %	98.48 %	88.64 %	93.94 %
Zhang et al. [46]	71.10 %	64.90 %	64.70 %	93.40 %	73.40 %	88.60 %
Le et al. [27]	X	X	X	95.00 %	91.67 %	90.00 %
Drira et al. [14]	93.11 %	92.46 %	91.24 %	95.47 %	92.46 %	94.53 %
AVERAGE	80.71 %	81.95 %	74.85 %	89.98 %	80.28 %	88.87 %

References

[4] Berretti S, Del Bimbo A, Pala P (2012) Real-time expression recognition from dynamic sequences of 3D facial scans. In: EG Workshop on 3D Object Retrieval, pp. 85-92

[8] Canavan SJ, Sun Y, Zhang X, Yin L (2012) A dynamic curvature based approach for facial activity analysis in 3D space. In: CVPR Workshops, pp. 14-19

[9] Chang Y, Vieira MB, Turk M, Velho L (2005) Automatic 3D facial expression analysis in videos. In: IEEE Workshop AMFG '05, pp. 293-307

[14] Drira H, Ben Amor B, Daoudi M, Srivastava A, Berretti S (2012) 3D dynamic expression recognition based on a novel deformation vector field and random forest. In: ICPR '12, pp. 1104-1107

[17] Fang T, Zhao X, Ocegueda O, Shah SK, Kakadiaris IA (2012) 3D/4D facial expression analysis: An advanced annotated face model approach. Elsevier Image Vis Comput **30**(10), 738-749

[18] Fang T, Zhao X, Shah SK, Kakadiaris IA (2011) 4D facial expression recognition. In: ICCV '11, pp. 1594-1601

[26] Jeni LA, Lórincz A, Nagy T, Palotai Z, Sebók J, Szabó Z, Takács D (2012) 3D shape estimation in video sequences provides high precision evaluation of facial expressions. Elsevier Image Vis Comput **30**(10), 785-795

[27] Le V, Tang H, Huang TS (2011) Expression recognition from 3D dynamic faces using robust spatio-temporal shape features. In: IEEE FG '11, pp. 414-421

[29] Rosato M, Chen X, Yin L (2008) Automatic registration of vertex correspondences for 3D facial expression analysis. In: IEEE International Conference on Biometrics: Theory, Applications and Systems, pp. 1-7

[31] Sandbach G, Zafeiriou S, Pantic M, Rueckert D (2011) A dynamic approach to the recognition of 3D facial expressions and their temporal models. In: IEEE FG '11, pp. 406-413

[32] Sandbach G, Zafeiriou S, Pantic M, Rueckert D (2012) Recognition of 3D facial expression dynamics. Elsevier Image Vis Comput **30**(10), 762-773

[36] Sun Y, Chen X, Rosato MJ, Yin L (2010) Tracking vertex flow and model adaptation for three-dimensional spatiotemporal face analysis. IEEE Trans Syst Man Cybern Part A **40**(3), 461-474

[38] Sun Y, Yin L (2008) Facial expression recognition based on 3D dynamic range model sequences. In: Springer Proc. ECCV '08: Part II, pp. 58-71

[39] Tsalakanidou F, Malassiotis S (2009) Robust facial action recognition from real-time 3D streams. In: CVPR '09, pp. 4-11

[40] Tsalakanidou F, Malassiotis S (2010) Real-time 2D+3D facial action and expression recognition. Elsevier Pattern Recogn 43(5):1763–1775

[43] Yin L, Wei X, Longo P, Bhuvanesh A (2006) Analyzing facial expressions using intensity-variant 3D data for human computer interaction. In: Proc. ICPR '06, pp. 1248-1251

[46] Zhang X, Reale M, Yin L (2013) Nebula feature: A space-time feature for posed and spontaneous 4D facial behavior analysis. In: IEEE FG '13